

Note: Snapshot PDF is the proof copy of corrections marked in EditGenie, the layout would be different from typeset PDF and EditGenie editing view.

Author Queries & Comments:

Q1 : Please check that the heading levels have been correctly formatted throughout.

Response: The heading "Music education in schools and music institutes" should not be 1st level heading. It should be 2nd level heading (printed smaller).

Q2 : The year for "Mishler 1999" has been changed to year to match the entry in the references list. Please provide revisions if this is incorrect.

Response: Resolved

Q3 : Please provide missing city for the reference "Lindeberg 2005" references list entry.

Response: Resolved

Q4 : Please provide city for the "Runco and Cayirdag 2013" references list entry.

Response: Resolved


Musical backgrounds and musical identity development in pre-service music education and primary education students: a narrative study

MUSIC EDUCATION RESEARCH

P. PAANANEN

Pirkko Paananen

Faculty of Education, Music Education, University of Oulu, Oulu, Finland

CONTACT Pirkko Paananen  pirkko.paananen@oulu.fi Faculty of Education, Music Education, University of Oulu, P. O. Box 8000, Oulu, FI-90014, Finland


History : received : 2020-10-21 accepted : 2021-12-7

Copyright Line: © 2021 Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group

ABSTRACT

This study examined Finnish first-and second-year music education major students and primary education students who participate 25-credits minor subject studies in music, childhood and adolescent musical experiences and musical paths. The participants ($N = 30$) were asked to write an essay on the topic 'Music and Me'. Using holistic content analysis, five different composite stories were formed, each representing a different developmental path to a specific musical identity type: pop/jazz musician, ensemble musician, classical musician, leisure musician and music listener. Using self-determination theory (Deci and Ryan 2000) and a combined framework of personal and social identity development (Albarelo, Crocetti, and Rubini 2018), it is proposed that versatility of instruction, consideration of basic psychological needs and fostering peer interaction are crucial to adolescent identity development, different musical identity types and pursuit of a musical career. Extended music programmes had a positive impact on participants' identity development.

KEYWORDS

-  Musical background
- musical identity
- musical self-concept
- narrative
- pre-service
- music teacher
- primary teacher

Introduction

Childhood and adolescent musical experiences form the basis of later development, influencing attitudes towards music, development of skills, motivation, self-concept and identity. The extent to which individuals learn to perceive themselves as musicians depends on a variety of environmental factors such as music instruction, supportive teachers, parents and peers (Barrett 2006; Lamont 2011; Moore, Burland, and Davidson 2003; Sichivitsa 2007; Sloboda and Davidson 1996) as well as informal music-making, access to music learning environments and online communities (Green 2008; Salavuo 2006). Positive experiences may lead to the pursuit of a musical or music-related profession. The aim of the present narrative study is to examine how Finnish pre-service music education major students and primary education students, who have chosen 25-credits minor subject studies in music (European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System, ECTS), describe their musical backgrounds and music in their identity development and to investigate possible developmental similarities and differences between different identities.

Prior studies on music education students' identities have mainly focused on students' descriptions of their adult professional identities or necessary skills in the music teaching profession (Ballantyne, Kerchner, and Aróstegui 2012; Beijaard, Meijer, and Verloop 2004; Bouij 1998; Draves 2021; Freer and Bennett 2012; Hargreaves et al. 2007; McClellan 2014). Pre-service music teachers generally perceive themselves first as musicians and later as music teachers, negotiating between the two sub-identities (Ballantyne, Kerchner, and Aróstegui 2012; Beijaard, Meijer, and Verloop 2004; Bouij 1998; Freer and Bennett 2012; Isbell 2008). Their identities are organised according to dimensions of professional role and musical comprehensiveness; both dimensions vary from broad to narrow, from all-around musicians to performers and from pupil- to content-centred teachers (Bouij 1998). They are likely to value skills that emphasise the personal and communicative aspects of the benefits of music (Hargreaves et al. 2007).

Much less is known about music education students' primary socialisation in music. The literature indicates that they generally come from musical home environments (Mark 1998) and receive support for their vocational orientation towards music education mostly from their school music teachers, while parents and instrument teachers encourage them more often towards a career in music performance (Isbell 2008). While McClellan (2014) found that peers and informal learning experiences were important in undergraduate identity formation as a music educator, the roles of peers and informal learning experiences in the identity development of adolescents who orientate towards a music educational vocation have not yet been extensively studied. Another open question is to what extent schools and music institutes take into account the role of peers in supporting their students' identity formation.

Primary education students' musical backgrounds have been studied more extensively, including both generalists who study compulsory music courses (4-5 ECTS) and those who participate 25-credits (ECTS) minor subject studies in music (Lindeberg 2005; Ruismäki and Tereska 2006, 2008). These studies are important as the majority of Finnish pre-service primary teachers typically regard their ability to teach music as only adequate (Suomi 2019). Early musical experiences appear to be related to both pre-service teachers' self-concept in music and their musical progress in teacher education: Ruismäki and Tereska (2006) found a strong correlation between early childhood pleasure in singing as well as having a piano at home and teacher education scores for singing and playing instruments. In parallel, Burak (2019) reported that primary education students who had previously played an instrument exhibited higher musical self-efficacy than others.

Ruismäki and Tereska (2008) found that pre-service teachers' assessments of the music instruction they had received in different phases of life were most positive in childhood. The most positive school experiences included choir and ensemble playing, while negative experiences were related to theoretical studies and solo singing tests. Negativity towards school music instruction increased until puberty and listening to music, particularly pop/rock genres, increased with age. Lindeberg (2005) determined that pre-service primary teachers' childhood singing experiences were generally positive, and the role of teachers in awakening enthusiasm for singing was significant. Adolescent voice change, however, generated doubts about one's voice or musicality for boys, who could abandon singing at this point.

However, these studies do not cover participants' experiences of extended music programmes of schools, music institutes or informal learning, although many primary music students do have formal or at least informal experiences in learning instruments. Moreover, the role of musical peers and communities of practice was not the subject of these studies.

Music education in schools and music institutes[Q1]

As Finnish schools and music institutes form the central context for individual narratives of this study, I will describe them next. In *comprehensive school* (from 7 to 15 years of age), music is a compulsory subject from grades 1 to 7, and optional at grades 8 and 9. *Upper secondary schools* (from 16 to 18 years of age) leading to matriculation examination cover regular academic subjects and one compulsory course in music.

Some comprehensive schools provide *extended music programmes* to be applied in via entrance tests (grades 3–6 and 7–9), where music is taught up to four hours per week. Similarly, *ten upper secondary schools offer extended music programmes*, which include versatile studies in both classical and popular music. These schools promote themselves as having an open-minded

atmosphere to grow up in, opportunities to get experience in performing to various audiences and networking with like-minded adolescents both inside and outside school. Eerola and Eerola (2014) found that pupils in extended music classes (grades 3–6) were significantly more satisfied with classroom climate than pupils in normal classes.

Basic Education of Art (BEA) is comprised of a network of music institutes throughout Finland which offer goal-oriented and systematic instruction in music. BEA provides an opportunity to study music for those who are interested in music as a hobby or as a career. Children apply to music institutes around 6–7 years of age. The majority (64–70%) of basic to advanced level students are girls (Klemettinen 2019). Instruction is generally built on a master-apprentice tradition; 75% of lessons are solo lessons (Klemettinen 2019). However, the latest National Core Curriculum for music in Basic Education in the Arts (2017) highlights the importance of musical creativity as well as cultural diversity, and a growing number of music institutes also offer pop and jazz education.

Theoretical lenses

Two theoretical frameworks were used to interpret participants' narratives of their musical identity development. The self-determination theory developed by Deci and Ryan (2000, 252) was found to be most suitable for examining the participants' motivation in music, as it provides a framework to analyse the fulfilment of participants' psychological needs. A combined framework of personal and social identity development (Albarelo, Crocetti, and Rubini 2018) was used to examine individuals' perceptions of their musical identity development.

Self-concept and self-determination theory

Self-concept comprises individuals' knowledge and beliefs about themselves and evolves through constant self-evaluation of one's abilities and the requirements of each situation (Oyserman 2001). As a regulatory mechanism, self-concept affects learning and motivation. Supportive experiences related to family, teachers, peers and institutions are essential in developing strong intrinsic motivation and perceiving oneself as a musician (Burland and Davidson 2002), whereas negativity of self-concept has been found to be related to perceived competence as well as hidden attitudes and beliefs, such as the illusion of perceived lack of talent (Lamont 2011).

According to self-determination theory (Deci and Ryan 2000), positive motivational consequences result from conditions that allow the satisfaction of three basic psychological needs, namely autonomy, competence and relatedness. *Autonomy* refers to the desire to self-organise experiences and behaviour and act in accordance with one's own sense of self (Deci and Ryan 2000). Autonomy is related to the need to do music for oneself (Lamont 2011) and possibilities to choose musical repertoire and activities (Evans, McPherson, and Davidson 2012). It forms an integral part of divergent thinking (Runco and Cayirdag 2013, 111). When creative engagement is not included, students may find school music lessons too traditional (Juntunen et al. 2014). Those individuals who regard musical creativity as an important part of their musical self may find the classical master-apprentice tradition too restricting.

Competence is the need to be challenged and to experience one's own effectiveness (Deci and Ryan 2000) in acquiring and executing one's musical skills. Lessons should be suitably challenging and interesting (Evans, McPherson, and Davidson 2012) and positive feedback from significant others is required. Moore, Burland, and Davidson (2003) reported that professional performing musicians' instrument teachers had been good musicians who had pushed their pupils towards their musical goals. To be able to continue their instrument studies, young musicians also need coping strategies for negative conditions, such as competition and pressure (Moore, Burland, and Davidson 2003). Solo performances, which may create performance anxiety, are more typical in classical music. In contrast, popular musicians develop their skills and perform in bands in more informal settings (Green 2008; Salavuo 2006).

Relatedness refers to the need to experience community and be connected to other individuals and groups (Deci and Ryan 2000) and it is crucial for social identity. Those who cease playing an instrument in adolescence usually have more negative social experiences than those who become professional musicians (Moore, Burland, and Davidson 2003). Evans, McPherson, and Davidson (2012) suggest that positive social relationships and students' participation in curriculum planning should be fostered to promote the need for relatedness. Genuine participation in the musical community is important in informal learning associated with popular music (Green 2008), and may enhance motivation and skills when included in music instruction (Hallam, Creech, and McQueen 2017). The instrument plays an important role in fulfilling the need for relatedness as orchestral and band instrument players get more joint playing experiences than, for example, pianists.

Personal and social identity development

While the development of self-concept begins in infancy, adolescence is the period in which *personal* identity emerges (Marcia 1980). Music may be something that one is good at or something that makes one feel good (music in identity), or it may define one's professional role in music (identity in music) (Hargreaves, MacDonald, and Miell 2002). Adolescents consolidate plans for

their future vocation (Marcia 1980) and define a personal way of being in a relationship with their significant others (Grotevant, Thorbecke, and Meyer 1982). In addition to personal identity, social identity formation is crucial in adolescence. While the social identity theory of Tajfel and Turner (1986) emphasises that belonging to a group and social identification affect individuals' self-definition, self-esteem and intergroup relationships, Albarello, Crocetti, and Rubini (2018) found that personal and social identity processes are also intertwined both concurrently and longitudinally. Adolescents increasingly define themselves as members of multiple peer groups, which involve processes of self-experimentation, social comparison, and support. The ways in which adolescents develop their identity in the educational and interpersonal domains become intertwined over time. Notably, social identifications influence personal identity formation.

While social influences have been acknowledged in literature, the possible role of musical peers in the development of the educational domain of adolescent musical identity is less understood. Applying the framework of Albarello, Crocetti, and Rubini (2018), it can be assumed that adolescents' commitments in their pursuit of a musical career may be strongly influenced by social interactions with their musical peers and friends. Therefore, schools and music institutes should create optimal conditions for the interplay of personal and social identity development in their students. This could be done by providing communities of musical practice for informal musical activities which support friendship, allow time with friends (Lamont 2011), encourage peer to peer learning and positive feedback, and provide real-life practices and genuine musical situations (Green 2008; Hallam, Creech, and McQueen 2017) for participation in different music cultures, which may function as the basis for identity work.

Musical identity as narrative configuration

Viewing the self as a narrative or a story, rather than a substance, brings to light the temporal and developmental dimension of human existence. (Polkinghorne 1991, 135)

The present study investigated how individuals perceive the development of their identities in searching for answers to the question, 'How have I become who I am?' Therefore, the narrative approach has been selected. In narrative psychology, self-narratives are perceived as identities, for individuals come to know who they are through the stories they tell about specific events in their lives. Narrative works as an organising process through which the lived past is interpreted (Bruner 1987; Lieblich, Tuval-Maschiah, and Zilber 1998; Polkinghorne 1991). The self is understood as having a past, present and future; the temporal organisation comprises *causal and enabling conditions* and episodes of practical activity are integrated with values and motives (Polkinghorne 1991, 143–147).

Hänninen (2004, 77) found that the *told* narrative is never an exact reflection of the *inner narrative* because the inner narrative does not necessarily work at fully conscious levels. It is the inner narrative that makes sense of the past, provides visions of the future, defines the individual's identity, articulates values, regulates emotions and sets goals (Hänninen 2004, 74–81). Nor is the inner narrative always fully verbal, but rather may work at the level of meanings and images (Hänninen 2004, 75) as well as musical improvisation and song writing (Barrett 2011; Derrington 2005).

Methodology

Participants ($N = 30$; 25 female, 5 male, age range 20–26 years) were first- or second-year university music education (43%) and primary education (57%) students, who were asked to write a free essay on the topic 'Music and Me'. They were encouraged to reflect on their previous experiences in and development from childhood to the present. The data were gathered at the beginning of a basic university course in music, and it comprised 30 narratives as each student wrote one story. The length of the stories varied from 2 to 4 typewritten pages.

Narratives may be processed analytically by breaking the text into units of content and analysing the material categorically and/or holistically, focusing on content and/or form (Lieblich, Tuval-Maschiah, and Zilber 1998). The present study represents a holistic content analysis: individual stories were analysed to form composite stories. In addition, thematic analysis provided support in forming composite stories systematically and comparing central features across individual stories and composite stories.

The basic logic of how each writer described their musical path and relation to music was first defined by a summarising sentence. Meaningful categories in each individual story were inferred and the themes that were central to various stories were formed. The themes included *phases of life*, in which most individual stories shared a common structure that began with a description of the childhood family and continued through childhood and adolescence to the present; *music*, which included singing, playing and creating music as well as musical styles and genres; *social and learning experiences, motivation, emotions* and descriptions of *musical self-concepts and identity*. Individual stories were classified into story types; the sentences of each story were reduced, similarities and differences in expression between stories were extracted and composite stories were constructed using parts of several original narratives (Mishler 1999 [Q2]). Each composite story described a developmental path of one specific musical identity type. The original stories did not explicitly share all the details of the type in which they were classified,

as the composite stories were abstractions.

Results

Five different composite stories describing the development of five specific musical identities were formed: pop/jazz musician, classical musician, ensemble musician, leisure musician and music listener. Music education students represented three identity types: ensemble musician (38%), pop/jazz musician (31%) and classical musician (31%). Primary education students of advanced music studies represented the following identity types: leisure musician (67%), classical musician (22%) and music listener (11%). The classical musician identity occurred in both groups of students. Leisure musician and music listener types were not found among music education students because of their vocational orientation towards a musical profession. The similarities and differences between the identity types are discussed after the following composite stories, which include quotes of different participants, whose names are fictionalised.

Pop/Jazz musician

My earliest musical memory is hearing a rock song at home. As a child, I did not pay much attention to music. I remember having played instruments in primary school and the guitar at home because my father had played it when he was younger. When I learned to play my first riffs at 10 years old, I became really interested in music. I started practising the guitar by watching video guitar lessons on YouTube.

My father taught me the Smoke on the Water riff and I got a spark in music immediately. I started learning to play the guitar by myself. I got feelings of success, when I learned chords and whole songs using power chords. (Jeff)

I got enthusiastic to rehearse chords and melodies from Youtube video lessons, more and more challenging stuff all the time. (Dave)

I liked to listen to music with my friends, with whom I put a band together. I wrote my first songs, though song-writing was not yet very important.

Me and my friends had the same taste in music. However, my parents did not like all songs we used to listen to. (Mick)

I took guitar lessons and later entered the music programme in upper secondary school. The atmosphere of that school was music-centred. Music became more and more important. I played in a band with my classmates on a daily basis. We often discussed musical genres and styles, and I learned to like many musical genres. Band playing became increasingly important, and I started to think that playing or teaching music could be my future profession.

In the secondary high extended music programme, we got free from compulsory subjects and trained a lot with my band mates, of which several were talented musicians. My musical taste changed towards progressive and psychedelic rock. (Steve)

I entered a conservatory in pursuit of developing my skills and becoming a professional musician. I found the culture of the conservatory performance-centred and competitive. However, I also gained success and motivating feedback. During professional studies, I began to appreciate many more styles of music and discovered that different styles and genres were related to different emotions. At present, I am a pop/jazz musician who likes to play any kind of music, especially enjoying improvisation and song-writing. As a teacher, I'd like to provide adolescents with the joy of playing that I have found myself.

I find improvisation one of the most interesting things. Often, when I improvise, I forget completely everything else. (Jeff)

Classical musician

I have musical parents. Both sing and play instruments. I remember classical music often playing at our home. I have been told that I sang my first songs before my second year of life. My mother took me to music preschool. I was eager to begin violin lessons in the music school at the age of six. I liked playing very much and learned fast.

My instrument teacher was gentle, encouraging and friendly. I was so enthusiastic to practice that my parents had to interrupt me to get to sleep in the evening. (Beth)

At the age of nine, I was eager to enter the extended music programme. I joined the choir and experienced many solo performances, concerts and music projects. I also started playing piano and studying music theory. My parents were very supportive and made possible all concert journeys, summer music camps, etc.

In the music programme my interests and friends were centred around music. (Tina)

I have encountered many successful but also unsuccessful moments in my musical path, sometimes losing my motivation to practice, but my violin teacher has been encouraging and empathetic. A peak experience was when I performed in a recital and succeeded in concentrating on music and playing so well that the audience held their breath and many people gave me positive feedback afterwards.

I regard myself as a classical musician. I like many kinds of music, but I especially like classical music. At present, I feel that I am too attached to notes. I would like to develop my creativity and learn to create music of my own. Lately, I have also started to think more about teaching music.

Because I have always been classical pianist, free accompaniment and improvisation are challenging for me. (Sally)

I'd like to learn creativity to develop my musical identity. (Alex)

Ensemble musician

My parents are active music listeners and singers. My mother sang to us in the evenings when we were kids. My father can play the guitar by ear. We used to listen to our favourite bands together with my father.

I have always been encouraged to engage in musical hobbies. We had a piano at home and I used to experiment with it by ear as a toddler. We used to invent all kinds of musical performances with instruments and toy instruments with my siblings and presented them to parents and relatives. We also went to musical preschool together.

I began piano lessons in music school at the age of seven. I think years of studying classical music have given me good musical skills. However, I remember wishing to play more pop music and study improvised accompaniment at piano lessons as a child. I used to listen to pop and rock music and watched YouTube videos of pop stars. I wanted to be like them.

In primary school, I learned a little to play band instruments. I especially enjoyed playing the drums. I used to watch Youtube videos of skilled child and adolescent singers: I wanted to be like them. (Joan)

I would have liked to play more free accompaniment and pop songs. Because of failures in classical solo performances, I suffered from performance anxiety. (Megan)

When I was nine, I started in the extended music programme in primary school. Learning to play band instruments was great, as well as ensemble playing and singing in many musical styles. I acquired good skills in piano accompaniment, too. My classmates and I put together a rock band, for which I wrote some songs. In secondary school, I started practicing more band instruments because I felt I would like to become a music teacher one day.

I made songs for our band. My school music teacher was very encouraging. She arranged our band to a band school and recommended that I should participate in the secondary high music programme. (Kathy)

Music theory and classical piano studies are important for music making, however, the most important thing has been the time in the extended music programme, in its versatile ensemble playing and ensemble singing. (Leah)

My musical taste grew more varied, especially in the secondary school extended music programme, where I had many skilled classmates. It was great fun to play together with them. I also joined the school choir.

In the secondary high music programme, many of my classmates were talented musicians. (Terry)

My musical skills and knowledge developed in the music programme. I got acquainted to many multi-instrumentalist classmates with whom it was fun to play together. (Joan)

I enjoy performing music in public in musical ensembles and accompanying singers. However, when performing classical piano, I do not feel self-assured. I am an omnivore and find interesting music in every style. At present, I feel my musical role is both ensemble player and music educator.

I have never dreamt of being a solo artist or solo professional musician because I prefer playing music in ensembles and because I get anxious when performing solo. (Wendy)

Leisure musician

When I was a child, I heard a lot of music at home. I remember my mother often sang children's songs. I also heard music often from the radio and listened to LPs together with my father. My sister and brother used to play toy instruments and invent their own songs with me. We had a piano that I liked to play by ear. Our parents encouraged us to play music from the beginning. I also remember musical games and music performances from preschool.

I started violin lessons when I was seven years old. I switched instruments after two years and started playing the piano. I continued lessons for six years. I liked playing the piano in the beginning. In addition to music, sports were included in my hobbies.

My motivation stopped because my instrument teacher concentrated in errors only. (Kim)

Goal-directed piano practicing did not interest me so much anymore. I could go to a piano lesson without any rehearsal. My learning pace slowed down, which created negative feelings in me. Eventually, I stopped playing piano.

Other hobbies were more important. Failures lowered my musical self-esteem. Public performing feels impossible for me. (Evelyn)

In secondary school extended music programme, I joined the choir and became interested in singing. Listening to my favourite music with friends was important at that time. We shared musical interests and became fans of pop stars.

In the music programme, we had lots of fun and learned many instruments and music theory as well. We performed a lot. We had a very good spirit in our class. Everybody felt safe to play music and perform in a secure environment. (Debbie)

In the advanced music courses of my primary education, I have noticed that my childhood musical hobbies have provided me with many skills. It is great to discover that I have found motivation to play the piano again. My musical self-esteem has increased. Although reading notation is still a bit challenging, I enjoy singing, but only by myself.

My piano technique is not good but it is enough for me that I can accompany singing. (Molly)

When accompanying at least one singer, the situation changes and I feel good to perform music. (Debbie)

The kind of music I like to listen to depends on the day and my mood. Music may entertain me or calm me down. It brings me many good memories. At present, my musical taste is varied.

Music listener

I remember music playing at home all the time. I heard children's music and my parents' favourite music. My sister and brother used to sing along with the LPs. I also remember the musical games and Christmas parties at primary school. My classmates and I used to invent choreographies to pop songs and sing along.

I started instrument lessons when I was nine years old, but I did not like them because I did not understand the teacher's instructions. I stopped my musical hobby after one year. In secondary school, I started listening to music more. I carried the MP3 player in my pocket and listened to music all the time.

I searched comfort and extra boost in happy feelings by listening music. Feelings defined what was playing in my MP3 player. (Jennifer)

Music is a really important part of my life because it is related to my feelings. It comforts me, gives me energy and creates pleasure and rhythm in my everyday life. Many important memories include music. I listen to many kinds of music.

When studying music as part of my primary education studies, I have learned new musical skills and developed a lot, although development would probably be faster if I had started playing musical instruments earlier in my life.

Even if you could not play any instrument well, you can enjoy music, I think. (Mary)

Discussion

Five different paths of musical identity development were found on the basis of narratives written by 30 Finnish music education major students and primary education students who participate in 25 ECTS studies in music. Typical *to classical* and *ensemble musicians* was an early onset of sustained, intrinsic motivation, as they began instrument studies at around four to six years of age. Some classical musicians choose to study music education while others choose primary education at university. Ensemble and

pop/jazz musicians were all music education students. *Pop/jazz musicians*, typically male, generally began playing an instrument around the age of 10–12. Their intrinsic motivation stemmed from listening to their favourite bands and following YouTube lessons and increased steadily towards professional studies in music. *Leisure musicians* started their instrument lessons at an early age but lost their motivation in adolescence. *Music listeners'* instrument playing was more casual and their experiences with instrument lessons were more negative. In line with previous studies (Bouij 1998; Ballantyne, Kerchner, and Aróstegui 2012; Freer and Bennett 2012), teaching music was not a central issue in the first- and second-year students' narratives. Moreover, the task was formulated so that the participants' attention was likely to be more focused on music than on teaching.

In line with previous studies (Ruismäki and Tereska 2006; Moore, Burland, and Davidson 2003), the participants' early childhood experiences were generally happy and mostly related to family. Most participants talked about singing and playing instruments with their family members before they started school. Similarly to the findings of Sloboda and Davidson (1996), their parents were typically non-professional music lovers. Mothers sang and played children songs with their children and took them to music preschool or instrument lessons more often, whereas fathers tended to listen or play popular music with them. In accordance with Sloboda and Davidson (1996) and Moore, Burland, and Davidson (2003), parental support, good instrument teachers along with positive interaction of student and teacher and strong intrinsic motivation played significant roles in positive development.

A novel finding was that social media, joint playing and creating music as well as discussions with musical peers were included in the descriptions as important supportive and inspiring experiences in childhood and adolescence, fulfilling adolescents' needs for relatedness and autonomy (Deci and Ryan 2000). Moreover, musical peers played an important role in informal learning as well as adolescent' personal and social identity development and pursuit towards a musical vocation, as suggested by Albarello, Crocetti, and Rubini (2018). These findings are comparable with McClellan's (2014) findings of peers' importance in undergraduate student identity formation.

Experiences with instrument teachers were both positive and negative. Some classical, ensemble and leisure musicians' instrument teachers tailored teaching according to student's individual needs. They were described with gratitude and affection. Negative experiences related to teacher, instruction, and repertoire, were reported by all identity types. In these situations, instrument lessons could be abandoned or replaced with informal studies. Some participants had ceased lessons due to disliking the goal-directedness of practising, lacking stronger intrinsic motivation or considering other hobbies more important.

Instrument lessons ceased for a variety of reasons, which were related to three psychological needs (Deci and Ryan 2000): *Autonomy-related* reasons were when teacher had ignored students' wishes to study improvised accompaniment, improvisation or popular music repertoire. *Competence-related* reasons were when instrument teachers' instructions had been poorly understood, the teacher had not been good enough, had demanded too little or too much, or had concentrated on errors, as well as slow progress, feelings of insufficient music reading ability or technical skills, and performance anxiety, which was generally related to solo performances of classical music or solo singing in public. Participants who reported experiences of performance anxiety had either abandoned performing or were learning to endure those situations, thus developing *coping strategies*, which were proposed as crucial for positive music development by Burland and Davidson (2002). Joint playing/singing and performing were generally described as positive experiences, *fulfilling the need for relatedness as well as competence*. Sometimes teacher–student 'chemistry' had been poor and bullying at school had lowered some students' self-esteem, unfulfilling the need for *relatedness*.

Positive school experiences were generally related to *extended music programmes* and *informal music-making in school*, typically in *pop/jazz*, *classical* and *ensemble musicians'* stories, which all represented professional musician identities. Extended music programmes were described as inspiring because of good spirit, in line with Eerola and Eerola (2014); versatile music-making, many concerts and projects, musical peer relationships and friends, formal/informal and creative musical activities, learning many new skills and performing in a safe environment. Thus, studying in these programmes appeared to fulfil participants' basic needs (Deci and Ryan 2000). During the time in the programme, informal joint playing, discussions about musical styles and genres as well as learning with and from band mates were common elements in the descriptions, reflecting the importance of peers in adolescent intertwined personal and social identity development and commitments in their pursuit of a musical career (Albarello, Crocetti, and Rubini 2018). 'Normal' school music experiences were seldom described. Negative school descriptions were rare and were usually related to assessment in music.

Music itself was a highly positive thing for everyone, fostering creativity and providing the means of self-expression, emotional self-regulation and coping strategies against school pressures. In accordance with Ruismäki and Tereska (2008), interest towards pop and rock increased in adolescence, which was described as a phase of change in the majority of narratives.

Musical creativity was typically present in the descriptions of most participants' early childhood. Freedom in musical expression, improvisation, song writing and musical versatility representing the need for autonomy (Deci and Ryan 2000) were particularly important elements in the adolescent identity development of *pop/jazz musicians*, *ensemble musicians* and some *leisure musicians*. *Classical musicians* enjoyed playing classical music and performing solo more than others. However, they hoped to develop their improvisation skills, for they had not learned these skills in the music institute. Inventing music was described as being based on personal skills and emotions, while ensemble/band playing/singing was described as social interaction that

created feelings of belongingness. Making and creating music together with peers in various styles and genres was frequently mentioned as inspiring.

Intrinsic motivation, acquisition and practicing of musical skills had been experienced as inspiring, whether enthusiasm towards music emerged from the start, later at instrument lessons or via social media. New skills and knowledge also increased motivation. Importantly, participants appreciated versatile, communal and creativity-fostering music instruction that was tailored according to students' individual needs. For many participants, the learning experiences of traditional classical performance-oriented education had not been motivating; this stands in stark contrast to extended music programmes of schools, which were described as inspiring, versatile and communal without exception.

Validity

The basis for assessing the validity of narrative analysis does not lie in representing the 'truth' but rather on 'trustworthiness' (Riessman 1993). Retrospective perspective provides a first step into an understanding of the development of different musical identities. A logical next step would be to conduct a longitudinal study with a larger sample of participants. As the majority of participants were female, reflecting the low percentage of boys in music institutes in Finland and in the profession of teaching music, further research is required on both girls' and boys' musical identity development.

Conclusions

The findings of this study indicate that to be able to support young individuals' basic needs for autonomy, competence and relatedness, and to support the intertwined interplay of personal and social identity development, music instruction in general schools, extended music programmes of schools as well as BEA music institutes should be versatile and consider individual students' needs, interests and musical identity types. While many participants succeeded in developing sustained intrinsic motivation, many clearly would have required greater support, more socially and informally based musical engagement and greater freedom of musical expression and creativity.

To support students' personal and social identity development, music/instrument teachers should be encouraging, tailor instruction according to students' needs and interests, allow freer repertoires and support joint playing, improvisation and composition. Schools and BEA music institutes should promote communal practices by including informal learning and social interaction with musical peers and friends in their instruction. Frequent joint music-making should be provided for all instrument players and singers, as well as participation in musical communities of practice, concerts and projects. As performance anxiety forms a risk for positive identity development, attention should be paid to fostering a safe and positive climate as well as necessary skills and strategies required in music performance situations.

The upper secondary schools' extended music programmes in particular have succeeded well in many respects, as reflected in the inspired stories of the present study. However, they by no means substitute the wide BEA network of music institutes. An open question is how music institutes will change now that the latest National Core Curriculum for music in Basic Education in the Arts (2017) has been brought into practice. The master-apprentice-based music performance centred curriculum is most suitable for the minority of students who develop a classical performing musician's identity. Many other students enjoy a larger variety of musical styles and genres, improvisation and creating music in social settings, some presenting greater need for autonomy and relatedness. Therefore, music institutes could perhaps apply popular music instruction methods in classical music to fulfil these needs in students.

The greater percentage of BEA students being female and the pop musicians of the present study being all male raises several questions. Moreover, parents in this study presented a different role as a music educator, fathers favouring informal popular music activities and mothers encouraging music institute studies. As gender is an important part of social identity, research on gender construction in home environments, schools and music institutes as well as gender sensitive music instruction of both classical and popular music is required in the future.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.

Notes on contributor

Pirkko Paananen graduated with a PhD in Music Education from the University of Jyväskylä, Finland, in 2003 and is currently Professor of Music Education in the University of Oulu, Finland. Professor Paananen's primary research interests include musical development, musical creativity, composition pedagogy and digital music learning environments. She has published research articles in journals such as *Music Education Research* and *Musicae Scientiae* and has presented the findings of her research at international conferences. She serves as a referee in several scientific journals and conferences, and has been participating in

scientific and organizing committees of international conferences such as The ESCOM Triennial Conferences and International Conference on Music Perception and Cognition (ICMPC).

References

- Albarelo, F., E. Crocetti, and M. Rubini.** 2018. "I and Us: A Longitudinal Study on the Interplay of Personal and Social Identity in Adolescence." *Journal of Youth and Adolescence* 47: 689–702.
- Ballantyne, J., J. L. Kerchner, and J. L. Aróstegui.** 2012. "Developing Music Teacher Identities: An International Multi-Site Study." *International Journal of Music Education* 30 (3): 211–226.
- Barrett, M. S.** 2006. "'Creative Collaboration': An 'Eminence' Study of Teaching and Learning in Music Composition." *Psychology of Music* 34 (2): 195–218.
- Barrett, M.** 2011. "Musical Narratives: A Study of a Young Child's Identity Work in and Through Music-Making." *Psychology of Music* 39 (4): 403–423.
- Beijaard, D., P. Meijer, and N. Verloop.** 2004. "Reconsidering Research on Teachers' Professional Identity." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 20 (2): 107–128.
- Bouij, C.** 1998. "Swedish Music Teachers in Training and Professional Life." *International Journal of Music Education* 32: 24–32.
- Bruner, J.** 1987. "Life as Narrative." *Social Research* 54 (19): 11–32.
- Burak, S.** 2019. "Self-Efficacy of Pre-School and Primary School Pre-Service Teachers in Musical Ability and Music Teaching." *International Journal of Music Education* 37 (2): 257–271.
- Burland, K., and J. W. Davidson.** 2002. "Training the Talented." *Music Education Research* 4: 121–140.
- Deci, E. L., and E. M. Ryan.** 2000. "The "What" and "Why" of Goal Pursuits. Human Needs and the Self-Determination of Behaviour." *Psychological Inquiry* 11: 227–268.
- Derrington, P.** 2005. "Teenagers and Songwriting: Supporting Students in a Mainstream Secondary School." In *Song Writing Methods, Techniques and Clinical Applications for Music Therapy Clinicians, Educators and Students*, edited by **F. Baker and T. Wigram**, 71–85. London: Jessica Kingsley.
- Draves, T. J.** 2021. "Exploring Music Student Teachers' Professional Identities." *Music Education Research* 23 (1): 28–40.
- Eerola, P.-S., and T. Eerola.** 2014. "Extended Music Education Enhances the Quality of School Life." *Music Education Research* 16 (1): 88–104.
- Evans, P., G. McPherson, and J. W. Davidson.** 2012. "The Role of Psychological Needs in Ceasing Music and Music Learning Activities." *Psychology of Music* 41 (5): 600–619.
- Freer, P. K., and D. Bennett.** 2012. "Developing Musical and Educational Identities in University Music Students." *Music Education Research* 14 (3): 265–284.
- Green, L.** 2008. *Music, Informal Learning and the School: A New Classroom Pedagogy*. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Grotevant, H. D., W. Thorbecke, and M. L. Meyer.** 1982. "An Extension of Marcia's Identity Status Interview Into the Interpersonal Domain." *Journal of Youth and Adolescence* 11: 33–47.
- Hallam, S., A. Creech, and H. McQueen.** 2017. "Teachers' Perceptions of the Impact on Students of the Musical Futures Approach." *Music Education Research* 19 (3): 263–275.
- Hänninen, V.** 2004. "A Model of Narrative Circulation." *Narrative Inquiry* 14 (1): 69–85.
- Hargreaves, D. J., R. A. R. MacDonald, and D. E. Miell.** 2002. "What Are Musical Identities, and Why Are They Important?" In *Musical Identities*, edited by **R. A. R. MacDonald, D. J. Hargreaves, and D. E. Miell**, 1–20. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hargreaves, D. J., R. J. Purves, G. F. Welch, and N. A. Marshall.** 2007. "Developing Identities and Attitudes in Musicians and Classroom Music Teachers." *British Journal of Educational Psychology* 77: 665–682.
- Isbell, D. S.** 2008. "Musicians and Teachers. The Socialization and Occupational Identity of Preservice Music Teachers." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 56 (2): 162–178.
- Juntunen, M.-L., S. Karlsen, A. Kuoppamäki, T. Laes, and S. Muhonen.** 2014. "Envisioning Imaginary Spaces for Musicking: Equipping Students for Leaping Into the Unexplored." *Music Education Research* 16 (3): 251–266.
- Klemettinen, T.** 2019. *Results of Member Enquiry*. [Jäsenkyselyn tuloksia.] Accessed on 9 July 2021. <http://www.musicedu.fi/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/Tilastotietoa-2019.pdf>.
- Lamont, A.** 2011. "The Beat Goes on: Music Education, Identity and Lifelong Learning." *Music Education Research* 13 (4): 369–388.

- Lieblich, A., R. Tuval-Maschiah, and T. Zilber.** 1998. *Narrative Research: Reading, Analysis, and Interpretation*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Lindeberg, A.-M.** 2005. *Millainen laulaja olen. Opettajaksi opiskelevan vokaalinen minäkuva. ["What Kind of a Singer am I? The Vocal Self-Image of the Student Teacher."]* PhD Diss. Joensuu, Finland: University of Joensuu.[Q3]
- Marcia, J.** 1980. "Identity in Adolescence." In *Handbook of Adolescent Psychology*, edited by **J. Adelson**, 159–187. New York: Wiley.
- Mark, D.** 1998. "The Music Teacher's Dilemma: Musician or Teacher?" *International Journal of Music Education* 32: 3–22.
- McClellan, E.** 2014. "'Undergraduate Music Education Major Identity Formation in the University Music Department.'" *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education* 13 (1): 279–309.
- Mishler, Elliot G.** 1999. *Storylines: Craftartists' Narratives of Identity*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Moore, D. G., K. Burland, and J. W. Davidson.** 2003. "The Social Context of Musical Success: A Developmental Account." *British Journal of Psychology* 94: 529–549.
- Oyserman, D.** 2001. "Self-Concept and Identity." In *The Blackwell Handbook of Social Psychology*, edited by **A. Tesser and N. Schwarz**, 499–517. Malden, MA: Blackwell.
- Polkinghorne, D. E.** 1991. "Narrative and Self-Concept." *Journal of Narrative and Life History* 1 (2 & 3): 135–153.
- Riessman, C. K.** 1993. *Narrative Analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Ruismäki, H., and T. Tereska.** 2006. "Early Childhood Musical Experiences: Contributing to Pre-Service Elementary Teachers' Self-Concept in Music and Success in Music Education (During Student Age)." *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal* 14 (1): 113–133.
- Ruismäki, H., and T. Tereska.** 2008. "Students' Assessments of Music Learning Experiences from Kindergarten to University." *British Journal of Music Education* 25 (1): 23–39.
- Runco, M. A., and N. Cayirdag.** 2013. "The Development of Children's Creativity." In *The Handbook of Research on the Education of Young Children*, 3rd ed., edited by **O. N. Saracho and E. Spodek**, 102–114. New York, NY: Routledge.[Q4]
- Salavuo, M.** 2006. "Open and Informal Online Communities as Forums of Collaborative Musical Activities and Learning." *British Journal of Music Education* 23 (3): 253–271.
- Sichivitsa, V. O.** 2007. "The Influences of Parents, Teachers, Peers and Other Factors on Students' Motivation in Music." *Research Studies in Music Education* 29 (1): 55–68.
- Sloboda, J., and J. Davidson.** 1996. "The Young Performing Musician." In *Musical Beginnings: Origins and Development of Musical Competence*, edited by **I. Deliège and J. Sloboda**, 171–189. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Suomi, H.** 2019. *Pätevä musiikin opettamiseen? Luokanopettajaksi valmistuvan musiikillinen kompetenssi perusopetuksen opetussuunnitelman perusteiden toteuttamisen näkökulmasta.* [Competent to Teach Music? The Musical Competence of Graduating Primary Teachers in Terms of the Implementation of the National Core Curriculum for Basic Education.] PhD diss., University of Jyväskylä.
- Tajfel, H., and J. C. Turner.** 1986. "The Social Identity Theory of Intergroup Behavior." In *Psychology of Intergroup Relation*, edited by **S. Worchel, and W. G. Austin**, 7–24. Chicago, IL: Hall.