

Palgrave Studies in Public Debt,
Spending, and Revenue

Series Editor
Gerald J. Miller
Arizona State University
Pheonix, AZ, USA

Palgrave Studies in Public Debt, Spending, and Revenue is a broad-ranging and interdisciplinary series dedicated to studying the latest issues, trends, and developments influencing a government's role in its economy. The series of studies covers not only the economy's impact on government size and scope but also the effects of governmental policies on efficient allocation of resources, distribution of income, and macroeconomic stabilization. The series is also dedicated to a fuller understanding of the policies and policy tools through which government leaders develop this role, from fiscal policy to budget and various incentives that provoke particular behaviors. The subjects covered resonate in university economics, public affairs, public policy, public management, and governance schools and departments. This series' primary attention is on North America (especially the United States and Canada) and related comparative policy research. National and sub-national (including state, provincial, regional, metropolitan, and local) topics are included. At the same time, the series tracks comparable developments in China and the European Union. The series focuses on fiscal systems as influenced by the public sector and the economy, in addition to contemporary themes relating to fiscal policy, taxation, public debt, education finance, fiscal federalism, and the effects such policy designs as those found in antipoverty programs, healthcare, agriculture, and defense have on fiscal systems. Books in this series focus on research and compelling professional practices addressing public policy issues that create varying degrees of inevitability in the behavior of individuals, taxpayers, organizations, capital markets, and financial systems.

More information about this series at
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14595>

Daniel Williams • Thad Calabrese
Editors

The Palgrave Handbook of Government Budget Forecasting

palgrave
macmillan

Editors

Daniel Williams
Austin W. Marx School of Public
and International Affairs
Baruch College
New York, NY, USA

Thad Calabrese
Robert F. Wagner Graduate School
of Public Service
New York University
New York, NY, USA

ISSN 2662-5148 ISSN 2662-5156 (electronic)
Palgrave Studies in Public Debt, Spending, and Revenue
ISBN 978-3-030-18194-9 ISBN 978-3-030-18195-6 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-18195-6>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: Carol and Mike Werner / Alamy Stock Photo
Cover design by eStudio Calamar

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Contents

1	Introduction	1
	<i>Daniel Williams and Thad Calabrese</i>	
Part I	International and National	9
2	Macroeconomic Theory and Forecasting	11
	<i>Gerald D. Cohen</i>	
3	Evaluating Government Budget Forecasts	37
	<i>Neil R. Ericsson and Andrew B. Martinez</i>	
4	Budget Preparation and Forecasting in the Federal Republic of Germany	71
	<i>Dörte Busch and Wolfgang Strehl</i>	
5	Revenue Forecasting in Low-Income and Developing Countries: Biases and Potential Remedies	89
	<i>Marco Cangiano and Rahul Pathak</i>	
6	The Reliability of Long-Run Budget Projections	115
	<i>Rudolph Penner</i>	
7	CBO Updated Forecasts: Do a Few Months Matter?	133
	<i>James W. Douglas and Ringa Raudla</i>	

Part II	State and Local	153
8	State Revenue Forecasting Practices: Accuracy, Transparency, and Political Participation	155
	<i>Emily Franklin, Carolyn Bourdeaux, and Alex Hathaway</i>	
9	Forecasting Post-Crisis Virginia Tax Revenue	177
	<i>Melissa McShea and Joseph Cordes</i>	
10	Bias Associated with Centrally Budgeted Expenditure Forecasts	201
	<i>Thad Calabrese and Daniel Williams</i>	
11	Excessive Revenue Underforecasting: Evidence and Implications from New York City's Property Tax	217
	<i>Geoffrey Propheter</i>	
12	Small Local Government Revenue Forecasting	241
	<i>Vincent Reitano</i>	
13	Current Midyear Municipal Budget Forecast Accuracy	257
	<i>Daniel Williams and Thad Calabrese</i>	
Part III	Subject Matter Specialties	273
14	Using Fiscal Indicator Systems to Predict Municipal Bankruptcies	275
	<i>Jonathan B. Justice, Marc Fudge, Helisse Levine, David D. Bird, and Muhammad Naveed Iftikhar</i>	
15	School District Enrollment Projections and Budget Forecasting	303
	<i>Peter Jones, Cole Rakow, and Vincent Reitano</i>	
16	Budget Uncertainty and the Quality of Nonprofit Charter School Enrollment Projections	325
	<i>Todd L. Ely</i>	

	Contents	vii
17 Forecasting for Prisons and Jails		345
<i>Bruce D. McDonald III, J. Winn Decker, and Matthew James Hunt</i>		
18 Government and Nonprofit Personnel Forecasting		361
<i>Vincent Reitano</i>		
19 Forecast Bias and Capital Reserves Accumulation		377
<i>Vincent Reitano, Peter Jones, Nathan Barrett, and Jacob Fowles</i>		
20 Consensus Forecasting		397
<i>J. Winn Decker and Bruce D. McDonald III</i>		
21 Ensemble Forecasting		413
<i>Kenneth A. Kriz</i>		
Part IV Conclusion		427
22 Conclusion		429
<i>Daniel Williams and Thad Calabrese</i>		
Index		437

Notes on Contributors

Nathan Barrett, PhD, is an associate director and senior research fellow at the Education Research Alliance for New Orleans at Tulane University, USA. He researches teacher policies, equity in education, education reform, and student discipline. His recent publications have appeared in *Educational Researcher*, *American Journal of Education*, and *Economics of Education Review*.

David D. Bird, MBA, JD, is a PhD student at the University of Delaware, USA, with expertise in public administration, public finance, public law, public policy, and qualitative and multi-method research.

Carolyn Bourdeaux, PhD, of the Andrew Young School of Policy Studies at Georgia State University, USA, studies state budget, tax, transportation, and environmental policy, as well as land use, economic development, education finance, and administrative reform. Her recent research includes cutback budgeting, tax reform, intergovernmental fiscal relations, and legislative budget processes and decision-making.

Dörte Busch of the Berlin School of Economics and Law's recent work includes evaluation of the law for the promotion and supervision of children in day care and day care of the state of Saxony-Anhalt, and project inventory of the procedural and administrative implementation of the budget for work.

Thad Calabrese, PhD, of the Wagner School at New York University, USA, studies public and nonprofit financial management. His research has appeared in the *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, *Public Administration Review*, *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, *Public Budgeting and Finance*, *Nonprofit Management & Leadership*, and *National Tax Journal*, among others.

Marco Cangiano, MSc, a former senior staff at the International Monetary Fund (IMF) is a senior research associate with the London-based Overseas Development Institute (ODI) and a senior technical advisor with the Better Than Cash Alliance, consulting for, among others, the IMF, the EC, and the Italian Ministry for the Economy and Finance.

Gerald D. Cohen, PhD, is the former Deputy Assistant Secretary for Macroeconomic Analysis at the U.S. Department of Treasury. He was responsible for monitoring, analyzing, and briefing senior staff on U.S. macroeconomic developments. He is a co-author of *Political Cycles and the Macroeconomy* with Alberto Alesina and Nouriel Roubini.

Joseph Cordes, PhD, is the Associate Director of the School of Public Policy and Public Administration at the George Washington University Regulatory Studies Center. He is the co-editor of *The Encyclopedia of Taxation and Tax Policy*, and co-editor of *Nonprofits and Business*. He has authored or co-authored over 40 scholarly articles and contributed over 20 chapters in edited volumes.

J. Winn Decker, MEd, is a PhD student in Public Administration at North Carolina State University, USA, and has served as an intern for the US Senate Committee on the Budget.

James W. Douglas, PhD, of the Department of Political Science and Public Administration at the University of North Carolina at Charlotte, USA, researches budgeting and forecasting. His recent research has appeared in *Public Organization Review*, *Policy Studies Journal*, *Public Administration Review*, the *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, and *Public Budgeting & Finance*.

Todd L. Ely, PhD, of the University of Colorado Denver's School of Public Affairs researches the financing of state and local public services, education finance, and public and nonprofit financial management. He has co-authored *Essentials of Public Service*, an introductory public administration textbook.

Neil R. Ericsson, PhD, is a staff economist in the Division of International Finance, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, Professor of Economics at The George Washington University, and an adjunct professor at the Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies (SAIS).

Jacob Fowles, PhD, of the University of Kansas School of Public Affairs and Administration, USA, researches secondary and tertiary education finance and policy. His research has appeared in *Public Administration Review*, the

Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, and the *Journal of Higher Education*, among others.

Emily Franklin, MA, is a fiscal analyst with the Carl Vinson Institute of Government and a former public finance fellow at the Center for State and Local Finance and Fiscal Research Center. Her areas of interest include international development and public finance.

Marc Fudge, PhD, of California State University, San Bernardino, USA, researches public budgeting and finance, performance management, and social equity. His recent work has appeared in *Public Financial Management* and the *Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting and Financial Management*.

Alex Hathaway, DC, MPP, is a research associate with the Center for State and Local Finance and the Fiscal Research Center at Georgia State University, USA. His research interests include healthcare finance, state fiscal practices, higher education policy, and program evaluation.

Matthew James Hunt, MPA, of North Carolina State University, USA, studies public financial management, governmental and nonprofit accounting, public budgeting process, political economy, and revenue forecasting in the public sector.

Muhammad Naveed Iftikhar is a PhD candidate in Urban Affairs and Public Policy at the University of Delaware's Joseph R. Biden, Jr. School of Public Policy & Administration, USA. His research and policy work focuses on public sector governance, entrepreneurship, and cities. He is a co-editor of *Urban Studies and Entrepreneurship* (2020).

Peter Jones, PhD, of the Department of Political Science and Public Administration at the University of Alabama at Birmingham, USA, researches public budgeting and finance, research methods, and education policy financial issues. His research has appeared in *Public Performance & Management Review*, *Metron*, and the *Journal of Education Finance*, among others.

Jonathan B. Justice, PhD, of the University of Delaware's Joseph R. Biden, Jr. School of Public Policy & Administration, USA, researches public budgeting and finance and professional accountability. His recent publications include the *Handbook of Local Government Fiscal Health* and articles in *Public Finance and Management*, *Public Performance and Management Review*, and *Public Integrity*.

Kenneth A. Kriz, PhD, of the University of Illinois at Springfield, USA, researches subnational debt policy and administration, public pension fund

management, government financial risk management, economic and revenue forecasting, and behavioral public finance. He has written more than 40 journal articles and book chapters and a textbook on quantitative research methods.

Helisse Levine, PhD, of Long Island University, Brooklyn, USA, researches economic and fiscal constraints on government organizations, social inequities in healthcare and government across race and ethnicity, and public administration pedagogy. Recent publications have appeared in *The American Review of Public Administration* and *Review of Public Personnel Administration*.

Andrew B. Martinez, MPhil, is a D.Phil. student at Oxford University, UK. Recent publications have appeared in *Econometrics*, *International Journal of Forecasting*, and *Journal of International Commerce and Economics*.

Bruce D. McDonald III, PhD, of the Department of Public Administration, North Carolina State University, USA, is a co-editor of the *Journal of Public Affairs Education* and the *Journal of Public and Nonprofit Affairs*. His research focuses on defense finance and human capital, local government fiscal health, and the history of public administration.

Melissa McShea, PhD, of the Department of Public Management at the John Jay College of Criminal Justice, USA, researches state and local public finance and public policy issues. In addition to working in the private and nonprofit sectors, McShea has served governments at the local, state, and federal levels.

Rahul Pathak, PhD, of the Marx School of Public and International Affairs at the Baruch College, USA, researches public finance and social policy. His research has appeared in *Public Administration Review*, *Regional Science and Urban Economics*, *State and Local Government Review*, and *State Tax Notes*.

Rudolph Penner, PhD, is retired from the Urban Institute, USA. His previous posts include the Congressional Budget Office, the Office of Management & Budget, and other distinguished appointments. He has received the Peter Rossi Award from the University of Maryland and Association for Public Policy Analysis & Management (APPAM) for his contributions to the theory of program evaluation and the Federal Budgeting Career Legacy Award from George Mason University.

Geoffrey Prophter, PhD, of the School of Public Affairs at the University of Colorado, Denver, USA, researches property tax policy and administration, land and economic development, and sports and urban affairs.

Cole Rakow, PhD, is an economist and revenue forecaster for the New York City Independent Budget Office, USA. His work focuses on the city's business taxes (corporate income tax and unincorporated business tax) and tracking changes in federal and state tax policy that can impact city tax collections.

Ringa Raudla, PhD, of the Ragnar Nurkse Department of Innovation and Governance at Tallinn University of Technology (TalTech), Estonia, researches budgeting, fiscal governance, fiscal policy, and other matters. She has written many articles and is a member of the editorial boards of *Governance*, *Urban Affairs Review*, *Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting & Financial Management*, and others.

Vincent Reitano, PhD, of the School of Public Affairs and Administration at Western Michigan University, USA, researches public budgeting and finance, public policy, and statistical methodology. His research has appeared in *American Review of Public Administration*, *Contemporary Economic Policy*, and *Public Budgeting & Finance*, among others.

Wolfgang Strehl worked as a guest lecturer at the Berlin School of Economics and Law, Germany, and has worked on business administration and management. His research interests include monetary economics, macroeconomics, economic inequality, the history of economic thought, and economic history. He has written discussion and working papers online at the Berlin School of Economics and Law in Russia and China.

Daniel Williams, PhD, of the Marx School of Public and International Affairs at Baruch College was previously the budget director for Virginia's Medicaid agency. His recent forecasting publications include *The Status of Budget Forecasting* with Thad Calabrese (*Journal of Public and Nonprofit Affairs*), and *The Rube Goldberg Machine of Budget Implementation* with Joseph Onochie (*Public Budgeting & Finance*).

List of Figures

Fig. 2.1	GDP growth components	14
Fig. 2.2	Contributions to productivity growth	17
Fig. 2.3	Long waves of productivity	22
Fig. 2.4	Ten-year Treasury term premium	29
Fig. 3.1	Government agency forecasts and outcomes (in logs) and forecast errors (in percent, expressed as a fraction) of the federal debt	45
Fig. 3.2	Hedgehog graphs of U.S. government agency forecasts of the federal debt (in logs)	45
Fig. 4.1	The development of Germany's debts	73
Fig. 4.2	The budget of Germany	82
Fig. 4.3	Revenue estimation, Federal Ministry of Finance (11 May 2017)	84
Fig. 5.1	The distribution of study sample across years	100
Fig. 5.2	Mean percentage forecast error (three fiscal years)	101
Fig. 5.3	Mean absolute percent forecast error (three fiscal years)	102
Fig. 5.4	Forecast error and per-capita GDP	103
Fig. 7.1	One-year deficit/surplus projection errors as a percent of GDP	139
Fig. 7.2	Five-year deficit/surplus projection errors as a percent of GDP	139
Fig. 7.3	One-year total revenue projection errors as a percent of GDP	141
Fig. 7.4	One-year individual income tax projection errors as a percent of GDP	141
Fig. 7.5	One-year corporate income tax projection errors as a percent of GDP	142
Fig. 7.6	One-year social insurance tax projection errors as a percent of GDP	142
Fig. 7.7	Five-year total revenue projection errors as a percent of GDP	143
Fig. 7.8	One-year total spending projection errors as a percent of GDP	144
Fig. 7.9	One-year mandatory spending projection errors as a percent of GDP	145

Fig. 7.10	One-year discretionary spending projection errors as a percent of GDP	145
Fig. 7.11	One-year interest projection errors as a percent of GDP	146
Fig. 7.12	Five-year total spending projection errors as a percent of GDP	147
Fig. 9.1	VAR w/exogenous variables (Static)	195
Fig. 9.2	BVAR with exogenous variables	196
Fig. 11.1	Citywide property tax rate, fiscal years 1980–2017	223
Fig. 11.2	OMB’s reserve forecast and actuals	228
Fig. 11.3	OMB’s reserve forecast and actuals as a percent of yield	229
Fig. 11.4	Comparing forecasted reserve for 2016 to actual reserve	230
Fig. 11.5	Comparing forecasted reserve for 2014, 2015, and 2015 to actual reserve	231
Fig. 11.6	Comparison of property tax revenue forecasts for fiscal year 2016	234
Fig. 15.1	Forecasting accuracy for per-pupil revenues: Error	318
Fig. 15.2	Forecasting accuracy for per-pupil revenues: Percent Error	318
Fig. 19.1	Fiscal slack’s relationship with fund balance	385
Fig. 19.2	Marginal impacts of revenue and expenditure biases on capital outlay reserves	389
Fig. 19.3	Marginal impacts of revenue and expenditure biases on building reserves	390
Fig. 21.1	Demonstration of simple average combination method	417
Fig. 21.2	Pseudo-out-of-sample forecast results	424

List of Tables

Table 2.1	How changes in economic assumptions might affect the federal budget (2019–2028)	12
Table 2.2	Five-year forecast errors	30
Table 3.1	Some studies evaluating U.S. federal budget agency forecasts, as characterized by forecaster, forecast horizon, variable forecast, and forecast period	40
Table 3.2	A comparison of root mean squared forecast errors	48
Table 3.3	Forecast-encompassing test statistics	51
Table 3.4	RMSEs of some individual and pooled forecasts	53
Table 3.5	Subsample RMSEs and corresponding Chow statistics	54
Table 3.6	Mincer–Zarnowitz <i>t</i> - and <i>F</i> -statistics for testing unbiasedness and efficiency	56
Table 3.7	IIS-based estimates of time-varying bias	59
Table 3.8	A summary of tools for forecast evaluation	60
Table 3.9	Estimates of time-varying bias from focused impulse indicator saturation with NBER-based turning-point dummies	62
Table 4.1	Basic structure of the debt brake	77
Table 5.1	Selected studies on revenue forecasting bias at the subnational level in the United States and Europe	94
Table 5.2	Major studies on revenue forecasting bias and its correlates in the EU and OECD countries	96
Table 5.3	Major studies on revenue forecasting bias and its correlates in low-income countries	97
Table 6.1	Errors in current policy projections of the 2018 debt-to-GDP ratio	121
Table 6.2	Average annual values for economic and demographic variables that underlie CBO’s extended baseline	126

Table 7.1	CBO forecast error statistics as a percent of GDP (1978–2017)	138
Table 7.2	Difference between CBO's initial and updated forecast errors as a percent of GDP (1978–2017)	148
Table 8.1	Midyear adjustments and MAPE by forecasting type	163
Table 8.2	Reasonable rationales and MAPE by forecasting type	167
Table 9.1	Explanation of levels of data and their descriptive statistics for years 1977–2014	184
Table 9.2	Explanation of data in log differences and descriptive statistics for years 1977–2014	185
Table 9.3	Measures of forecast error	191
Table 10.1	Analysis of central and distributed expenditure budget suppluses and deficits	207
Table 10.2	Harrisonburg agencies categorized as distributed	209
Table 10.3	Comparison of surplus between localities	211
Table 11.1	Variance between initial property tax forecast and actual collections	235
Table 13.1	Localities examined	261
Table 13.2	Comparison data for forecast accuracy expectations, MAPE, SMAPE, and percent improved	263
Table 13.3	Analysis of midyear budget forecast improvement	265
Table 13.4	Analysis of errors by year	266
Table 13.5	Evaluation of midyear budget improvement	267
Table 14.1	Three fiscal-indicator systems	288
Table 14.2	California cities in the sample	289
Table 14.3	Index scores for nine California cities using the Michigan system	291
Table 14.4	Index scores for nine California cities using the Crosby and Robbins (2013) system	291
Table 14.5	Index scores for nine California cities using the Ohio Auditor's System (Rescaled)	292
Table 14.6	Component indicators of the Michigan Fiscal Stress Index	296
Table 14.7	Component indicators of the Crosby and Robbins Fiscal Stress Index	297
Table 14.8	Component indicators of the Ohio Auditor of State Index	298
Table 15.1	Forecast accuracy measures for sample of districts	315
Table 15.2	Forecast accuracy measures changes over time for Kentucky school districts	316
Table 16.1	Summary statistics	332
Table 16.2	Missed forecast error model results	339
Table 19.1	Descriptive statistics	386
Table 19.2	Difference of means for explanatory variables, comparing districts that reported a fund balance versus those that did not	387

Table 19.3	Fixed effects regression results without controls	388
Table 19.4	Fixed effects regression results with controls	388
Table 21.1	Variables used in forecasting models	420
Table 21.2	Forecast models estimated	421
Table 21.3	Absolute Percentage Errors (APE) for static 2012 forecast model	422
Table 21.4	Absolute Percentage Errors (APE) for dynamic recursive forecast models	423