

# **HHS Public Access**

Author manuscript

Nat Immunol. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 August 31.

Published in final edited form as:

Nat Immunol. 2016 May 19; 17(6): 618–625. doi:10.1038/ni.3466.

# Immunometabolism of regulatory T cells

### Ryan Newton<sup>1,2</sup>, Bhavana Priyadharshini<sup>1,2</sup>, and Laurence A Turka<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Center for Transplantation Sciences, Department of Surgery, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

### Abstract

The bidirectional interaction between the immune system and whole-body metabolism has been well recognized for many years. Via effects on adipocytes and hepatocytes, immune cells can modulate whole-body metabolism (in metabolic syndromes such as type 2 diabetes and obesity) and, reciprocally, host nutrition and commensal-microbiota-derived metabolites modulate immunological homeostasis. Studies demonstrating the metabolic similarities of proliferating immune cells and cancer cells have helped give birth to the new field of immunometabolism, which focuses on how the cell-intrinsic metabolic properties of lymphocytes and macrophages can themselves dictate the fate and function of the cells and eventually shape an immune response. We focus on this aspect here, particularly as it relates to regulatory T cells.

Resting T cells are relatively inert from a metabolic standpoint and require little energy generation or expenditure to 'keep the engine idling'. Upon activation, their energy needs increase substantially and, as will be described below, various substrates, including glucose, amino acids (especially glutamine) and fatty acids, are used to meet this demand. Most of the initial studies of T cells focused on naive T cells and effector T cells ( $T_{eff}$  cells)–memory T cells ( $T_{mem}$  cells), which have both shared metabolic features and distinct metabolic features. Subsequently, increasing attention has been focused on regulatory T cells ( $T_{reg}$  cells), with the recognition that these cells have their own signaling and metabolic 'preferences' that can drive and dictate their function and stability.

The best-characterized subset of  $T_{reg}$  cells is defined by expression of the co-receptor CD4, the cytokine receptor CD25 and the transcription factor Foxp3 (encoded by an X-linked gene). The importance of  $T_{reg}$  cells is exemplified by patients with the immunodeficiency syndrome IPEX ('immunodys regulation polyendocrinopathy enteropathy X-linked') and mice of the scurfy strain, each of which lack functional Foxp3 and suffer from severe systemic autoimmunity.  $T_{reg}$  cells can originate in the thymus, as well as extrathymically in the periphery as a consequence of the induction of Foxp3 expression following the activation of naive T cells<sup>1</sup>. In this Review, we will use 'tT<sub>reg</sub> cells' for thymus-derived T<sub>reg</sub> cells, 'pT<sub>reg</sub> cells' for peripherally induced T<sub>reg</sub> cells, and 'iT<sub>reg</sub> cells' for *in-vitro*-generated T<sub>reg</sub>

Reprints and permissions information is available online at http://www.nature.com/reprints/index.html.

Correspondence should be addressed to L.A.T. (lturka@partners.org).  $^2{\rm These}$  authors contributed equally to this work

COMPETING FINANCIAL INTERESTS

The authors declare no competing financial interests.

cells<sup>2</sup>. Although  $T_{reg}$  cells and  $pT_{reg}$  cells share many key features, such as their reliance on Foxp3 expression and dependence on interleukin 2 (IL-2) for their suppressive function and maintenance, they differ in the repertoires of their T cell antigen receptors (TCRs) and in the epigenetic marking of control elements in the *Foxp3* locus<sup>3–7</sup>. Most importantly, of course, they differ in whether Foxp3 is expressed constitutively ( $tT_{reg}$  cells) or whether its expression is induced following antigen-mediated activation ( $pT_{reg}$  cells). Given these distinctions, it is likely that  $tT_{reg}$  cells and  $pT_{reg}$  cells will not be found to be metabolically identical, and these differences might arise from specific developmental programming and/or context-dependent external cues.

In this Review we aim to provide a comprehensive understanding of the metabolic properties of both subsets of  $T_{reg}$  cells (i.e., thymus derived and extra-thymically induced) and how these can modulate and be reciprocally influenced by the immune response.

### T cell bioenergetics and features of T<sub>reg</sub> cell metabolism

Upon being activated, resting naive T cells that differentiate toward the  $T_{eff}$  cell lineage shift from catabolic energy metabolism to an anabolic state. This is driven predominantly by the glycolytic-lipogenic pathway and is associated with glutamine oxidation that fuels mitochondrial oxidative phosphorylation through the tricarboxylic acid (TCA) cycle. This use of aerobic glycolysis, similar to the metabolism in many cancer cells, is called the 'Warburg effect' and is orchestrated via the mTOR-dependent nutrient-sensing pathway activated downstream of signaling via the kinases PI(3)K and Akt<sup>8–10</sup>. As an immune response resolves, cells that persist and/or transit into the memory pool (as demonstrated by CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells) revert to a catabolic state and rely mainly on lipid oxidation regulated by signaling via the AMP-activated kinase AMPK and promoted by increased mitochondrial biogenesis, both of which are associated with cellular longevity and the ability of T cells to rapidly respond to reinfection<sup>10–12</sup>.

Glycolysis-driven *de novo* fatty-acid synthesis is a critical determinant of the fate of the  $T_H1$ ,  $T_H2$  and  $T_H17$  subsets of helper T cells<sup>13–15</sup>. Consistent with that,  $T_{eff}$  cell differentiation can be inhibited by various means, including inhibition of HIF-1a ('hypoxia-inducible factor 1a'), the transcription factor required for glycolysis; blockade of PDHK ('pyruvate dehydrogenase kinase'), the TCA enzyme that indirectly promotes glycolysis by blocking pyruvate dehydrogenase (PDH); or blockade of ACC1 ('acetyl-CoA carboxylase 1'), the key enzyme that drives fatty-acid synthesis. This has been demonstrated not only genetically but also pharmacologically, via treatment with 2-deoxy-glucose (2-DG), dicholoroacetate or soraphen, which block each of those three processes, respectively (Table 1). Notably, this not only inhibits  $T_{eff}$  cell differentiation but also promotes i $T_{reg}$  cell induction<sup>14,16,17</sup>.

 $T_{reg}$  cells that develop *in vivo* (t $T_{reg}$  cells) resemble  $T_{eff}$  cells in that they depend on glycolysis-driven lipogenesis for their proliferation and functional fitness, with the mevalonate pathway demonstrated to be particularly important in this subset<sup>18</sup>. Interestingly, studies of mouse B16 melanoma tumor models have shown that intratumoral and splenic  $T_{reg}$  cells exhibit more glucose uptake than do non- $T_{reg}$  cells<sup>19</sup>. Moreover, *in vivo* blockade

of glycolysis and glutaminolysis and enhancement of fatty-acid oxidation (FAO) diminishes the proliferation of  $T_{reg}$  cells (although to a lesser degree than the effect on  $T_{eff}$  cells) in a model of infection with vaccinia virus and adoptive transfer of T cells<sup>20</sup>. Although such studies have suggested a clear metabolic distinction between  $tT_{reg}$  cells and  $iT_{reg}$  cells (the latter being probably indicative of  $pT_{reg}$  cells as well), these differences are probably context dependent (Fig. 1a). Subsequent to those studies, it was reported that human  $T_{reg}$  cells isolated *ex vivo* are highly glycolytic and engage in both glycolysis and FAO when cultured *in vitro*<sup>21</sup>. Furthermore, in a model in which human  $T_{reg}$  cells were induced *in vitro* by suboptimal TCR stimulation without use of the cytokines TGF- $\beta$  or IL-10, glycolysis was shown to be required for optimal induction of Foxp3 expression and  $T_{reg}$  cell function (discussed in more detail below).

Amino acids, particularly glutamine and leucine, have an essential role in  $T_{eff}$  cell differentiation. However,  $iT_{reg}$  cells seem to be less dependent on amino acids for their energy needs. For example, depriving CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells of glutamine leads to their differentiation toward a  $T_{reg}$  cell phenotype<sup>22</sup>. Conversely, the glutamine-derived TCA-cycle intermediate  $\alpha$ -ketoglutarate enhances  $T_H1$  differentiation by promoting expression of the transcription factor T-bet<sup>22</sup>. In addition, genetic deficiency in neutral-amino-acid transporters such as Slc7a5 and Slc1a5 diminishes glutamine uptake and glucose metabolism and decreases  $T_{eff}$  cell differentiation without effects on the generation of  $iT_{reg}$  cells<sup>23,24</sup> (Fig. 1).

Interestingly, the metabolic byproducts of tryptophan catabolism, such as kynurenine, promote the generation of  $iT_{reg}$  cells by binding to the aryl hydrocarbon receptor<sup>25–27</sup>. Depleting cells of tryptophan can also lead to activation of the amino-acid-starvation response via the kinase GCN2, with resultant inhibition of  $T_H 17$  differentiation<sup>27,28</sup>. Furthermore,  $T_{reg}$  cells have been shown to increase their expression of amino-acid-catabolizing enzymes such as ARG1 ('arginase 1'), HDC ('histidine decarboxylase'), TDH ('threonine dehydrogenase') and IL4I1 ('interleukin-4 induced 1'; similar to 1-amino-acid oxidase) in skin grafts and bone-marrow-derived dendritic cells, which suggests that  $T_{reg}$  cells can modulate the concentration of certain amino acids and their catabolic products in the local milieu, an effect that can itself 'preferentially' enhance suppression mediated by  $T_{reg}$  cells<sup>27</sup>.

To meet their energetic demands,  $T_{mem}$  cells depend on FAO, a process that is dependent upon Cpt1a ('carnitine palmitoyltransferase 1A'), the rate-limiting enzyme for mitochondrial lipid uptake<sup>11</sup>. To support this pathway,  $T_{mem}$  cells depend upon both exogenous glycerol and endogenous lipids (Fig. 1b). They import exogenous glycerol via IL-7-induced expression of the pore-forming membrane protein AQP9 ('glycerol channel aquaporin 9') and also generate lipids *de novo* from glucose<sup>29</sup>. Furthermore,  $T_{mem}$  cells express the enzyme LAL ('lysosomal acid lipase'), which hydrolyzes glucose-derived endogenous cholesterol esters and triacylglyerols to fuel FAO<sup>30</sup>. Both  $tT_{reg}$  cells and  $pT_{reg}$ cells seem to exhibit some metabolic features that resemble those of  $T_{mem}$  cells, in that  $pT_{reg}$ cells can depend upon FAO (mirroring i $T_{reg}$  cells), while  $tT_{reg}$  cells utilize a glycolyticlipogenic cholesterol-biosynthetic pathway for both survival and optimal suppressive function, as described in the previous section<sup>13,14,18,31</sup> (Fig. 1b). Whether  $tT_{reg}$  cells can

import exogenous fatty acids and/or use their endogenous stores of triacylglycerides to feed FAO is not yet known (Fig. 1b).

Some features of T<sub>reg</sub> cell metabolism are also closely tied to anatomical location. For example, the dependence of T<sub>reg</sub> cells on lipid metabolism in vivo is particularly evident in tissue-resident T<sub>reg</sub> cells that localize in non-lymphoid tissues such as visceral adipose tissue (VAT) and intestinal mucosa<sup>32,33</sup>. VAT  $T_{reg}$  cells express PPAR $\gamma$  ('peroxisome proliferatoractivated receptor- $\gamma$ '), a master regulator of adipocyte differentiation and function, and have high expression of CD36, a scavenger receptor that facilitates the import of exogenous fatty acids<sup>31,33</sup>. Like other  $T_{reg}$  cells, VAT  $T_{reg}$  cells also express leptin receptors<sup>32,34,35</sup>. Moreover, adipocytes in the VAT of obese mice have high expression of leptin, which results in overactivation of mTOR in  $T_{reg}$  cells and a decrease in the number of  $T_{reg}$  cells<sup>35</sup>. Conversely, the VAT of lean aged male mice or mice deficient in leptin or its receptor shows enrichment for  $T_{reg}$  cells<sup>31,36</sup>. As an example from another anatomical site, the colon provides an environment rich in short-chain fatty acids, such as butyrate, acetate and propionate, that are generated from the bacterial fermentation of dietary fiber, and this has been closely linked to promoting the generation of  $T_{reg}$  cells<sup>32,33,37–39</sup>. One mechanism by which butyrate induces T<sub>reg</sub> cells in the gut is through inhibition of histone deacetylases, which enhances the acetylation of histone H3 at Lys27 at the Foxp3 locus and thereby increases Foxp3 expression<sup>37–39</sup>. Tissue-resident  $T_{reg}$  cells are therefore attuned to local metabolic cues that can be exploited for their phenotypic and functional specialization, as well as for 'preferential' survival in the tissue microenvironment.

### Metabolic control of T<sub>reg</sub> cells by mTOR

The mTOR-dependent nutrient-sensing pathway is composed of two distinct complexes: mTORC1 and mTORC2. In T cells, mTORC1 activity is elicited by signaling through the TCR and the co-receptor CD28 (ref. 40), as well as through the expression and activity of nutrient transporters<sup>23,24,41</sup>. For example, the glutamine transporter ASCT2 and the system-L transporter Slc7a5 (which 'preferentially' mediates the uptake of leucine) are both critical for sustained mTORC1-dependent expression of the transcription factor c-Myc and optimal T<sub>H</sub>1 and T<sub>H</sub>17 differentiation of naive T cells. Notably, either transporter is dispensable for the induction of iT<sub>reg</sub> cells. Consistent with that, leucine transport is required for the expression of other nutrient transporters, such as Glut1 and CD71, and Glut1 expression itself has emerged as a critical factor in driving glycolysis in Teff cells, whereas Treg cells generated either in vitro or in vivo develop and function independently of Glut1 (ref. 41). These examples illustrate how amino acids control metabolism in an mTOR-dependent manner, affecting mainly Teff cells and sparing Treg cells. Moreover, one mechanism by which Treg cells achieve suppression relies on the induction, in antigen-presenting cells, of the expression of amino-acid-consuming enzymes such as IDO (upregulated through T<sub>reg</sub> cell-specific ligation of the costimulatory molecules CD80 or CD86 via the inhibitory receptor CTLA-4) and ARG1 (upregulated by inflammation), which block the proliferation of  $T_{eff}$  cells and promote the induction of  $T_{reg}$  cells via inhibition of mTOR signaling<sup>42</sup>.

The main negative regulator of PI(3)K activity in T cells is the lipid phosphatase PTEN<sup>43,44</sup>.  $T_{reg}$  cell–specific deletion of PTEN enhances a glycolytic program in association with

compromised function and lineage instability<sup>45</sup>. Moreover, PTEN has been shown to be critical in limiting Akt activity and, consequently, maintaining the transcription-factor activity of Foxo3a in intratumoral  $T_{reg}$  cells through the semaphorin Sema4a and neuropilin Nrp1, which suggests that this pathway might be a potential therapeutic target for the potentiation of anti-tumor responses and limiting of  $T_{reg}$  cell-mediated tolerance to tumors<sup>46</sup>. It has also been reported that IDO-induced activation and function of  $T_{reg}$  cells requires activation of PTEN via the checkpoint receptor PD-1 and that PTEN-deficient  $T_{reg}$ cells are compromised in their ability to create a suppressive tumor microenvironment<sup>47</sup>. In activated T cells, PD-1 inhibits the transport and utilization of both glucose and glutamine and alters the metabolic program from glycolysis to FAO, which suggests that PD-1 might affect metabolism through PTEN-mediated control of PI(3)K signaling<sup>48</sup>.

Although strong PI(3)K signals clearly have a negative effect on the differentiation, function and stability of Treg cells, this does not indicate that Treg cells are completely PI(3)K independent<sup>45,47,49</sup>. Indeed, an oscillatory nature of mTOR signaling in T<sub>reg</sub> cells in response to leptin and nutrients has been described<sup>34</sup>. Furthermore, PI(3)K signaling via the TCR and IL-2 maintains functional fitness and suppressive activity via mTORC1-mediated induction of cholesterol and lipid metabolism and upregulation of CTLA-4 expression<sup>18</sup> (Figs. 1b and 2). Interestingly, mTORC1 has a role in inhibiting the mTORC2 pathway in Treg cells, and mTORC2 activity is required for Akt-mediated inhibition of Foxo transcription factors. Given the importance of these transcription factors in the development, maintenance and function of Treg cells, it is possible that the ability of mTORC1 to inhibit mTORC2 contributes to the control of metabolism via maintenance of the activity of Foxo transcription factors in the nucleus 50-52. This is consistent with the finding that Foxo1 inhibits glycolytic and oxidative metabolism through antagonizing c-Myc function. Of note, Foxo1 also has a role in the memory formation and function of CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells<sup>53,54</sup>. CD8<sup>+</sup> T<sub>mem</sub> cells are perhaps the population most similar to T<sub>reg</sub> cells in their metabolic profile, and we are tempted to speculate that their metabolic properties and reliance on Foxo1 signaling are interrelated.

An alternative to mTOR-driven metabolism is the AMPK-dependent pathway, which promotes mitochondrial oxidative metabolism and suppresses mTOR signaling and glycolysis<sup>55</sup>. A crucial role for AMPK in  $T_{eff}$  cells under conditions of limited nutrient availability has been demonstrated<sup>56</sup>. Activated T cells with less access to glucose undergo a metabolic checkpoint marked by decreased mTORC1 activity that limits cell growth, cytokine production and proliferation but maintains cellular ATP levels, cell viability and the ability to resume cytokine production following the re-introduction of glucose. In the absence of AMPK during periods of glucose starvation, T cells are deficient in their ability to suppress mTORC1 activation, undergo metabolic reprogramming, and utilize glutamine to generate TCA-cycle intermediates for the support of oxidative phosphorylation.

 $T_{reg}$  cells maintain high levels of AMPK activation, which mimics the metabolism of nutrient-deprived  $T_{eff}$  cells, although important differences remain, in particular the reliance of  $T_{reg}$  cells on lipid oxidation<sup>13</sup>. This aspect of the metabolic profile of  $T_{reg}$  cells is particularly evident in the context of deficiency in the receptor ERRa, which leads to a block in glucose oxidation and glucose-dependent lipid synthesis. In this case, lipids restore

the differentiation of  $T_{reg}$  cells, but pyruvate does not, and neither is able to restore  $T_H1$ ,  $T_H2$  or  $T_H17$  cells<sup>57</sup>. Interestingly, in the absence of glutamine, the activation of naive T cells (even under  $T_H1$ -skewing conditions) results in loss of mTORC1 activity and differentiation into  $T_{reg}$  cells<sup>22</sup>. This is dependent on a decrease in intracellular levels of the glutamine-derived metabolite  $\alpha$ -ketoglutarate, which identifies a role for intracellular metabolite production in the direct control of cell fate in the context of nutrient availability.

### Metabolic control of Foxp3 and T<sub>reg</sub> cell lineage stability

Instability of the Treg cell lineage is associated with inflammatory conditions and is closely linked to alterations in metabolism<sup>45,46,58,59</sup>.  $T_{reg}$  cell–specific deletion of Atg7 or Atg5, which encode two factors essential to autophagy, also leads to compromised stability of the Treg cell lineage due to unchecked control of mTORC1-dependent c-Myc expression and glycolysis<sup>58</sup>. While unrestrained glycolytic activity in T<sub>reg</sub> cells can contribute to their dysfunction, it is likely that glycolysis also has an important role in supporting this population. In human iTreg cells generated by sub-optimal TCR stimulation, the glycolytic activity of enolase-1 can promote the induction of FOXP3 splice variants containing exon 2 to confer suppressive activity<sup>60</sup> (Fig. 2). After pharmacological blockade of glycolysis with 2-DG during the generation of iTreg cells, non-glycolytic activity of enolase-1 represses FOXP3 expression, while silencing of enolase-1 under these same conditions restores FOXP3 transcripts and expression of the exon-2-containing FOXP3 splice variants. This bifunctionality of a metabolic enzyme, whereby enolase-1 has distinct functions depending on whether or not T<sub>reg</sub> cells are engaged in glycolysis, has a parallel in T<sub>eff</sub> cells, in which GAPDH inhibits the production of interferon- $\gamma$  when disengaged from glycolysis as a result of cellular reliance on oxidative metabolism<sup>15</sup>. Given the highly proliferative nature of  $T_{reg}$ cells, it might not be surprising that they engage glycolysis under certain contexts. This has been directly characterized through analysis of mouse iT<sub>reg</sub> cell metabolism and in human T<sub>reg</sub> cells assessed ex vivo immediately after isolation or cultured in vitro<sup>16,21</sup>. Whether there is a greater reliance on glycolysis in human  $T_{reg}$  cells than in mouse  $T_{reg}$  cells, under physiological and pathological conditions, and whether this contributes to or diminishes suppressive capacity, remain to be determined.

Under certain contexts, the glycolytic ability of  $T_{reg}$  cells might be indispensable. In activated T cells, this shift toward glycolysis is driven by c-Myc<sup>9</sup>.  $T_H17$  cells, however, rely on a HIF-1 $\alpha$ -driven glycolytic program<sup>17</sup>. Interestingly,  $T_H17$  cells and  $iT_{reg}$  cells demonstrate a reciprocal relationship in which the expression of HIF-1 $\alpha$  represents a metabolic 'tipping point' between these two populations. This is true both under hypoxic conditions and normoxic conditions and relies in part on targeting of Foxp3 for degradation through direct binding of HIF-1 $\alpha^{61}$  (Fig. 2). Surprisingly, the HIF-1 $\alpha$  pathway has been revealed to induce Foxp3 expression under hypoxic conditions, which constitutes a negative feedback loop for controlling  $T_{eff}$  cell responses elicited under inflammatory hypoxic conditions<sup>62</sup>. This again illustrates (as does the role of enolase-1 in  $T_{reg}$  cells) that in certain contexts, a glycolytic program might be required for  $T_{reg}$  cells to actively engage in suppressive activity.

The regulation of chromatin by the CD28-dependent histone methyl-transferase EZH2 is critical in maintaining a Foxp3-dependent gene program in  $T_{reg}$  cells, particularly in nonlymphoid tissues and in settings of induced inflammation<sup>63</sup>. However EZH2 also regulates non- $T_{reg}$  cells. Glycolysis-driven EZH2 expression in CD4<sup>+</sup> or CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells is required for cytokine production in the context of anti-tumor responses<sup>64</sup>. Through glucose restriction imposed by the tumor microenvironment, T cells maintain expression of a set of microRNAs that target EZH2 expression, which results in loss of T cell polyfunctionality and cytokine production. Such studies suggest that glycolytic reprogramming occurs in coordination with chromatin modifications. As  $T_{reg}$  cell stability has now been shown to be dependent on EZH2 expression, it remains to be determined if this occurs in a glycolysis-dependent manner (Fig. 2).

Interestingly, metabolism might also influence  $T_{reg}$  cell stability through direct modulation of Foxp3 expression. Translocation of the transcription factor NFAT into the nucleus downstream of TCR stimulation is crucial for its association with the conserved noncoding sequence CNS2 region and *Foxp3* promoter region<sup>65</sup>. In activated T cells, optimal NFAT activity has been shown to be dependent on reactive oxygen species (ROS) induced by Ca<sup>2+</sup> mobilization and mitochondrial metabolism<sup>66</sup> (Fig. 2). Additionally, glycolytic metabolites such as phosphoenol pyruvate (PEP) can also augment Ca<sup>2+</sup> mobilization by blocking the ATPase SERCA ('sarcoplasmic or endoplasmic reticulum calcium ATPase')<sup>19</sup> (Fig. 2). Given the varying dependence of T<sub>reg</sub> cells on glycolysis and mitochondrial oxidation and increased levels of mitochondrial ROS in T<sub>reg</sub> cells<sup>16</sup>, it is plausible that glycolytic metabolites such as PEP and mitochondrial ROS might affect Foxp3 expression via the modulation of proximal TCR signaling and NFAT activity in T<sub>reg</sub> cells.

Foxp3 is also subject to multiple post-translational modifications, as well as posttranslational regulation by microRNA. Acetylation of Foxp3, which is dependent on nuclear pools of acetyl-CoA, promotes Treg cell stability, whereby the deacetylase SIRT1 directly targets Foxp3 and subsequently increases the poly-ubiquitination of Foxp3 and its proteasomal degradation. This potentially links metabolic regulation of acetyl-CoA levels with Foxp3 expression and might be particularly relevant in balancing the induction of  $T_H 17$ cells versus that of  $T_{reg}$  cells, in which reliance on fatty-acid synthesis ( $T_{H}17$  cells) versus FAO (iTreg cells) can directly affect acetyl-CoA levels. Notably, inhibition of SIRT1 can increase the transcriptional activity of Foxp3 in human T<sub>reg</sub> cells<sup>67–69</sup>. The activity of SIRT1 is NAD<sup>+</sup> dependent, and it is possible that SIRT1-dependent degradation of Foxp3 is linked to glycolytic flux, in which NAD<sup>+</sup> is regenerated from the fermentation of pyruvate to lactate by metabolic enzymes, such as LDHA, that regulate the NAD<sup>+</sup>-NADH balance. The regulation of other intracellular metabolites, such as adenylates that influence AMPK activity, might influence the stability of Foxp3 as well. Whether Foxp3 expression itself can reinforce certain metabolic features that strengthen lineage stability remains to be demonstrated. It is interesting that the gene encoding phosphodiesterase PDE3B, which functions to hydrolyze cAMP and cGMP, has been shown to be one of the Foxp3 targets most downregulated in  $T_{reg}$  cells<sup>70</sup>. Although the functional consequences of this are not entirely known, it has been suggested that repression of PDE3B is important for the proliferative fitness of Treg cells and their expression of a set of mitochondrial and biosynthetic proteins.

In addition to having a crucial intracellular role, bioenergetic intermediates such as NAD<sup>+</sup> and ATP can also be released during cell damage and inflammation, in which they can activate the P2X7 (P2 purinergic) receptors that have high expression on  $T_{reg}$  cells and thus compromise their function and survival<sup>71</sup>. Conversely,  $T_{reg}$  cells, via the pathway of the ATP ectonucleotidase CD39 and the extracellular AMP nucleotidase CD73, are able to metabolize extracellular ATP to adenosine that can bind to adenosine receptors (such as A2AR) on responding conventional T cells and inhibit their function<sup>28</sup>. Together these findings suggest that both intracellular metabolic mediators and extracellular metabolic mediators can modulate the homeostasis and function of  $T_{reg}$  cells (Table 1).

## Modulating T<sub>reg</sub> cell function by manipulating metabolism

The field of immunometabolism is growing at an exponential rate, and delineation of the different utilization of metabolic pathways by distinct subsets of T cells, including  $T_{reg}$  cells, suggests the exciting possibility that this might provide a means for subset-specific targeting (Table 1). In the context of transplantation, blocking glycolysis and glutamine metabolism with 2-DG and the glutamine analog DON, respectively, and promoting FAO with metformin prevents the rejection of skin and heart allografts, probably through ablation of all lymphocyte proliferation<sup>20</sup>. With the benefit of greater preservation of immunological function, drugs such as metformin and acetyl-CoA carboxylase inhibitors have been shown to 'preferentially' enhance  $pT_{reg}$  cell differentiation while blocking  $T_H1$  or  $T_H17$  differentiation in autoimmune mouse models of allergic asthma and experimental autoimmune encephalitis, respectively<sup>14</sup>. Along similar lines, blocking glycolysis via 2-DG or by inhibition of PDHK can selectively impair  $T_{eff}$  cells and improve  $T_{reg}$  cell function in experimental autoimmune encephalitis<sup>16,17</sup> (Table 1).

In situations in which blocking  $T_{reg}$  cell function is desirable, such as in the tumor microenvironment, much attention has been focused on the role of PI(3)K-Akt in  $T_{reg}$  cells. A published study has suggested that  $T_{reg}$  cells are induced in response to apoptotic tumor cells in an IDO-dependent manner and block  $T_{eff}$  cell-mediated tumor elimination<sup>47</sup>. In this setting, pharmacological inhibition of either IDO or PTEN is associated with loss of Foxo3a (a target of Akt),  $T_{reg}$  cell destabilization and rapid tumor regression<sup>47</sup>. Unexpectedly, expression of an Akt-insensitive mutant of Foxo1 that is constitutively retained in the nucleus has been shown to 'preferentially' ablate tumor-infiltrating and non-lymphoid-tissue activated  $T_{reg}$  cells and thereby lead to enhanced anti-tumor responses by CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells. This suggests that an alternative outcome might follow PI(3)K blockade under certain contexts in which retention of Foxo1 in the nucleus of  $T_{reg}$  cells could potentially lead to their functional disruption<sup>72</sup>.

### Concluding remarks

It is apparent from the literature reviewed above that while the understanding of  $T_{reg}$  cell metabolism has progressed substantially in only a few years, much remains unknown. While genetic targeting of mice has yielded a great deal of new information, an obvious limitation is the extent to which mouse  $T_{reg}$  cells and human  $T_{reg}$  cells might differ from each other in their use of, and dependence on, distinct metabolic pathways. Additionally, the majority of

Page 9

studies so far have assessed  $T_{reg}$  cell metabolism during differentiation or responses *in vitro*; it is certainly possible that metabolism *in vivo* differs from that *in vitro* due to various contextual features, such as cytokines, antigenic competition, tissue hypoxia and so on. Moreover,  $T_{reg}$  cell metabolism *in vivo* varies by the site and type of immune response. Such plasticity of metabolism might be an important consideration in the design of approaches to target  $T_{reg}$  cells or their subpopulations for immunomodulation. Finally, a limitation of many *in vivo* models is their frequent inability to distinguish between effects on  $tT_{reg}$  cells and those on  $pT_{reg}$  cells, which represents a key point, as data increasingly suggest that these two populations might act very differently from a metabolic standpoint. The use of pharmacological agents to manipulate metabolism in animals is an important step forward in the development of clinically relevant strategies, with the understanding, of course, that such drugs probably have effects on all lymphocyte populations, not just  $T_{reg}$  cells.

Thus, the setting of *ex vivo* T<sub>reg</sub> cell population expansion and adoptive immunotherapy might be an ideal one in which to begin to apply immunomodulatory strategies. Such an approach has been used in an adoptive-transfer model of tumor-specific T cells in which limiting glycolysis during *in vitro* proliferation was shown to enhance *in vivo* persistence and anti-tumor efficacy<sup>73</sup>. The advent of genetic manipulation by CRISPR-based technologies presents an additional opportunity for the cell-specific manipulation of genes encoding products that control metabolic pathways as well, as might prove useful in enhancing the effectiveness of chimeric-antigen-receptor-based T cell therapies<sup>74</sup>. At present, this would need to be done in the adoptive-cell-therapy setting, but if *in vivo* cell-specific CRISPR targeting can be developed, then direct *in situ* approaches might prove possible one day.

#### Acknowledgments

We thank B. Blazar, J. Bluestone, H. Chi, J. Rathmell and members of the Turka laboratory for discussions. Supported by the US National Institutes of Health (P01-HL018646 to L.A.T. and B.P., and T32-AI007529 to R.N.).

### References

- Yadav M, Stephan S, Bluestone JA. Peripherally induced tregs—role in immune homeostasis and autoimmunity. Front Immunol. 2013; 4:232. [PubMed: 23966994]
- Abbas AK, et al. Regulatory T cells: recommendations to simplify the nomenclature. Nat Immunol. 2013; 14:307–308. [PubMed: 23507634]
- 3. Curotto de Lafaille MA, Lafaille JJ. Natural and adaptive foxp3<sup>+</sup> regulatory T cells: more of the same or a division of labor? Immunity. 2009; 30:626–635. [PubMed: 19464985]
- Ohkura N, et al. T cell receptor stimulation-induced epigenetic changes and Foxp3 expression are independent and complementary events required for Treg cell development. Immunity. 2012; 37:785–799. [PubMed: 23123060]
- Maloy KJ, Powrie F. Fueling regulation: IL-2 keeps CD4<sup>+</sup> T<sub>reg</sub> cells fit. Nat Immunol. 2005; 6:1071–1072. [PubMed: 16239920]
- Fontenot JD, Rasmussen JP, Gavin MA, Rudensky AY. A function for interleukin 2 in Foxp3expressing regulatory T cells. Nat Immunol. 2005; 6:1142–1151. [PubMed: 16227984]
- D'Cruz LM, Klein L. Development and function of agonist-induced CD25<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>+</sup> regulatory T cells in the absence of interleukin 2 signaling. Nat Immunol. 2005; 6:1152–1159. [PubMed: 16227983]

- Pollizzi KN, Powell JD. Integrating canonical and metabolic signalling programmes in the regulation of T cell responses. Nat Rev Immunol. 2014; 14:435–446. [PubMed: 24962260]
- 9. Wang R, et al. The transcription factor Myc controls metabolic reprogramming upon T lymphocyte activation. Immunity. 2011; 35:871–882. [PubMed: 22195744]
- Pearce EL, Poffenberger MC, Chang CH, Jones RG. Fueling immunity: insights into metabolism and lymphocyte function. Science. 2013; 342:1242454. [PubMed: 24115444]
- van der Windt GJ, et al. Mitochondrial respiratory capacity is a critical regulator of CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell memory development. Immunity. 2012; 36:68–78. [PubMed: 22206904]
- Pearce EL, et al. Enhancing CD8 T-cell memory by modulating fatty acid metabolism. Nature. 2009; 460:103–107. [PubMed: 19494812]
- Michalek RD, et al. Cutting edge: distinct glycolytic and lipid oxidative metabolic programs are essential for effector and regulatory CD4<sup>+</sup> T cell subsets. J Immunol. 2011; 186:3299–3303. [PubMed: 21317389]
- Berod L, et al. De novo fatty acid synthesis controls the fate between regulatory T and T helper 17 cells. Nat Med. 2014; 20:1327–1333. [PubMed: 25282359]
- Chang CH, et al. Posttranscriptional control of T cell effector function by aerobic glycolysis. Cell. 2013; 153:1239–1251. [PubMed: 23746840]
- Gerriets VA, et al. Metabolic programming and PDHK1 control CD4<sup>+</sup> T cell subsets and inflammation. J Clin Invest. 2015; 125:194–207. [PubMed: 25437876]
- Shi LZ, et al. HIF1alpha-dependent glycolytic pathway orchestrates a metabolic checkpoint for the differentiation of TH17 and Treg cells. J Exp Med. 2011; 208:1367–1376. [PubMed: 21708926]
- Zeng H, et al. mTORC1 couples immune signals and metabolic programming to establish T<sub>reg</sub>-cell function. Nature. 2013; 499:485–490. [PubMed: 23812589]
- Ho PC, et al. Phosphoenolpyruvate is a metabolic checkpoint of anti-tumor t cell responses. Cell. 2015; 162:1217–1228. [PubMed: 26321681]
- 20. Lee CF, et al. Preventing allograft rejection by targeting immune metabolism. Cell Reports. 2015; 13:760–770. [PubMed: 26489460]
- 21. Procaccini C, et al. The proteomic landscape of human ex vivo regulatory and conventional T cells reveals specific metabolic requirements. Immunity. 2016; 44:406–421. [PubMed: 26885861]
- 22. Klysz D, et al. Glutamine-dependent α-ketoglutarate production regulates the balance between T helper 1 cell and regulatory T cell generation. Sci Signal. 2015; 8:ra97. [PubMed: 26420908]
- Sinclair LV, et al. Control of amino-acid transport by antigen receptors coordinates the metabolic reprogramming essential for T cell differentiation. Nat Immunol. 2013; 14:500–508. [PubMed: 23525088]
- Nakaya M, et al. Inflammatory T cell responses rely on amino acid transporter ASCT2 facilitation of glutamine uptake and mTORC1 kinase activation. Immunity. 2014; 40:692–705. [PubMed: 24792914]
- 25. Mezrich JD, et al. An interaction between kynurenine and the aryl hydrocarbon receptor can generate regulatory T cells. J Immunol. 2010; 185:3190–3198. [PubMed: 20720200]
- Opitz CA, et al. An endogenous tumour-promoting ligand of the human aryl hydrocarbon receptor. Nature. 2011; 478:197–203. [PubMed: 21976023]
- 27. Buck MD, O'Sullivan D, Pearce EL. T cell metabolism drives immunity. J Exp Med. 2015; 212:1345–1360. [PubMed: 26261266]
- 28. Priyadharshini B, Turka LA. T-cell energy metabolism as a controller of cell fate in transplantation. Curr Opin Organ Transplant. 2015; 20:21–28. [PubMed: 25563988]
- 29. Cui G, et al. IL-7-induced glycerol transport and TAG synthesis promotes memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell longevity. Cell. 2015; 161:750–761. [PubMed: 25957683]
- O'Sullivan D, et al. Memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells use cell-intrinsic lipolysis to support the metabolic programming necessary for development. Immunity. 2014; 41:75–88. [PubMed: 25001241]
- 31. Cipolletta D, et al. PPAR- $\gamma$  is a major driver of the accumulation and phenotype of adipose tissue T<sub>reg</sub> cells. Nature. 2012; 486:549–553. [PubMed: 22722857]
- Zeng H, Chi H. Metabolic control of regulatory T cell development and function. Trends Immunol. 2015; 36:3–12. [PubMed: 25248463]

- Burzyn D, Benoist C, Mathis D. Regulatory T cells in nonlymphoid tissues. Nat Immunol. 2013; 14:1007–1013. [PubMed: 24048122]
- Procaccini C, et al. An oscillatory switch in mTOR kinase activity sets regulatory T cell responsiveness. Immunity. 2010; 33:929–941. [PubMed: 21145759]
- 35. Procaccini C, Galgani M, De Rosa V, Matarese G. Intracellular metabolic pathways control immune tolerance. Trends Immunol. 2012; 33:1–7. [PubMed: 22075206]
- 36. Feuerer M, et al. Lean, but not obese, fat is enriched for a unique population of regulatory T cells that affect metabolic parameters. Nat Med. 2009; 15:930–939. [PubMed: 19633656]
- Arpaia N, et al. Metabolites produced by commensal bacteria promote peripheral regulatory T-cell generation. Nature. 2013; 504:451–455. [PubMed: 24226773]
- Smith PM, et al. The microbial metabolites, short-chain fatty acids, regulate colonic Treg cell homeostasis. Science. 2013; 341:569–573. [PubMed: 23828891]
- Furusawa Y, et al. Commensal microbe-derived butyrate induces the differentiation of colonic regulatory T cells. Nature. 2013; 504:446–450. [PubMed: 24226770]
- Yang K, Neale G, Green DR, He W, Chi H. The tumor suppressor Tsc1 enforces quiescence of naive T cells to promote immune homeostasis and function. Nat Immunol. 2011; 12:888–897. [PubMed: 21765414]
- 41. Macintyre AN, et al. The glucose transporter Glut1 is selectively essential for CD4 T cell activation and effector function. Cell Metab. 2014; 20:61–72. [PubMed: 24930970]
- Cobbold SP, et al. Infectious tolerance via the consumption of essential amino acids and mTOR signaling. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 2009; 106:12055–12060. [PubMed: 19567830]
- Finlay DK, et al. Phosphoinositide-dependent kinase 1 controls migration and malignant transformation but not cell growth and proliferation in PTEN-null lymphocytes. J Exp Med. 2009; 206:2441–2454. [PubMed: 19808258]
- Newton RH, et al. Suppression of T-cell lymphomagenesis in mice requires PTEN phosphatase activity. Blood. 2015; 125:852–855. [PubMed: 25477498]
- Huynh A, et al. Control of PI(3) kinase in T<sub>reg</sub> cells maintains homeostasis and lineage stability. Nat Immunol. 2015; 16:188–196. [PubMed: 25559257]
- 46. Delgoffe GM, et al. Stability and function of regulatory T cells is maintained by a neuropilin-1semaphorin-4a axis. Nature. 2013; 501:252–256. [PubMed: 23913274]
- 47. Sharma MD, et al. The PTEN pathway in Tregs is a critical driver of the suppressive tumor microenvironment. Sci Adv. 2015; 1:e1500845. [PubMed: 26601142]
- Patsoukis N, et al. PD-1 alters T-cell metabolic reprogramming by inhibiting glycolysis and promoting lipolysis and fatty acid oxidation. Nat Commun. 2015; 6:6692. [PubMed: 25809635]
- Haxhinasto S, Mathis D, Benoist C. The AKT-mTOR axis regulates de novo differentiation of CD4+Foxp3+ cells. J Exp Med. 2008; 205:565–574. [PubMed: 18283119]
- Kerdiles YM, et al. Foxo transcription factors control regulatory T cell development and function. Immunity. 2010; 33:890–904. [PubMed: 21167754]
- Ouyang W, et al. Foxo proteins cooperatively control the differentiation of Foxp3<sup>+</sup> regulatory T cells. Nat Immunol. 2010; 11:618–627. [PubMed: 20467422]
- Ouyang W, et al. Novel Foxo1-dependent transcriptional programs control T<sub>reg</sub> cell function. Nature. 2012; 491:554–559. [PubMed: 23135404]
- Rao RR, Li Q, Gubbels Bupp MR, Shrikant PA. Transcription factor Foxo1 represses T-betmediated effector functions and promotes memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell differentiation. Immunity. 2012; 36:374–387. [PubMed: 22425248]
- Tejera MM, Kim EH, Sullivan JA, Plisch EH, Suresh M. FoxO1 controls effector-to-memory transition and maintenance of functional CD8 T cell memory. J Immunol. 2013; 191:187–199. [PubMed: 23733882]
- Shackelford DB, Shaw RJ. The LKB1-AMPK pathway: metabolism and growth control in tumour suppression. Nat Rev Cancer. 2009; 9:563–575. [PubMed: 19629071]
- Blagih J, et al. The energy sensor AMPK regulates T cell metabolic adaptation and effector responses in vivo. Immunity. 2015; 42:41–54. [PubMed: 25607458]

- 57. Michalek RD, et al. Estrogen-related receptor-α is a metabolic regulator of effector T-cell activation and differentiation. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 2011; 108:18348–18353. [PubMed: 22042850]
- Wei J, et al. Autophagy enforces functional integrity of regulatory T cells by coupling environmental cues and metabolic homeostasis. Nat Immunol. 2016; 17:277–285. [PubMed: 26808230]
- 59. Feng Y, et al. Control of the inheritance of regulatory T cell identity by a cis element in the Foxp3 locus. Cell. 2014; 158:749–763. [PubMed: 25126783]
- De Rosa V, et al. Glycolysis controls the induction of human regulatory T cells by modulating the expression of FOXP3 exon 2 splicing variants. Nat Immunol. 2015; 16:1174–1184. [PubMed: 26414764]
- Dang EV, et al. Control of T<sub>H</sub>17/T<sub>reg</sub> balance by hypoxia-inducible factor 1. Cell. 2011; 146:772– 784. [PubMed: 21871655]
- Clambey ET, et al. Hypoxia-inducible factor-1 α-dependent induction of FoxP3 drives regulatory T-cell abundance and function during inflammatory hypoxia of the mucosa. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 2012; 109:E2784–E2793. [PubMed: 22988108]
- 63. DuPage M, et al. The chromatin-modifying enzyme Ezh2 is critical for the maintenance of regulatory T cell identity after activation. Immunity. 2015; 42:227–238. [PubMed: 25680271]
- 64. Zhao E, et al. Cancer mediates effector T cell dysfunction by targeting microRNAs and EZH2 via glycolysis restriction. Nat Immunol. 2016; 17:95–103. [PubMed: 26523864]
- 65. Li X, Liang Y, LeBlanc M, Benner C, Zheng Y. Function of a Foxp3 cis-element in protecting regulatory T cell identity. Cell. 2014; 158:734–748. [PubMed: 25126782]
- 66. Sena LA, et al. Mitochondria are required for antigen-specific T cell activation through reactive oxygen species signaling. Immunity. 2013; 38:225–236. [PubMed: 23415911]
- 67. van Loosdregt J, et al. Regulation of Treg functionality by acetylation-mediated Foxp3 protein stabilization. Blood. 2010; 115:965–974. [PubMed: 19996091]
- van Loosdregt J, et al. Rapid temporal control of Foxp3 protein degradation by sirtuin-1. PLoS One. 2011; 6:e19047. [PubMed: 21533107]
- Wellen KE, et al. ATP-citrate lyase links cellular metabolism to histone acetylation. Science. 2009; 324:1076–1080. [PubMed: 19461003]
- Gavin MA, et al. Foxp3-dependent programme of regulatory T-cell differentiation. Nature. 2007; 445:771–775. [PubMed: 17220874]
- Hubert S, et al. Extracellular NAD<sup>+</sup> shapes the Foxp3<sup>+</sup> regulatory T cell compartment through the ART2-P2X7 pathway. J Exp Med. 2010; 207:2561–2568. [PubMed: 20975043]
- Luo CT, Liao W, Dadi S, Toure A, Li MO. Graded Foxo1 activity in T<sub>reg</sub> cells differentiates tumour immunity from spontaneous autoimmunity. Nature. 2016; 529:532–536. [PubMed: 26789248]
- Sukumar M, et al. Inhibiting glycolytic metabolism enhances CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell memory and antitumor function. J Clin Invest. 2013; 123:4479–4488. [PubMed: 24091329]
- 74. Kawalekar OU, et al. Distinct signaling of coreceptors regulates specific metabolism pathways and impacts memory development in CAR T cells. Immunity. 2016; 44:380–390. [PubMed: 26885860]
- 75. Deaglio S, et al. Adenosine generation catalyzed by CD39 and CD73 expressed on regulatory T cells mediates immune suppression. J Exp Med. 2007; 204:1257–1265. [PubMed: 17502665]
- 76. Borsellino G, et al. Expression of ectonucleotidase CD39 by Foxp3<sup>+</sup> Treg cells: hydrolysis of extracellular ATP and immune suppression. Blood. 2007; 110:1225–1232. [PubMed: 17449799]
- 77. Leone RD, Lo YC, Powell JD. A2aR antagonists: Next generation checkpoint blockade for cancer immunotherapy. Comput Struct Biotechnol J. 2015; 13:265–272. [PubMed: 25941561]
- 78. Shrestha S, et al. T<sub>reg</sub> cells require the phosphatase PTEN to restrain T<sub>H</sub>1 and T<sub>FH</sub> cell responses. Nat Immunol. 2015; 16:178–187. [PubMed: 25559258]
- 79. Bian L, et al. Dichloroacetate alleviates development of collagen II-induced arthritis in female DBA/1 mice. Arthritis Res Ther. 2009; 11:R132. [PubMed: 19723321]

- Thebault P, et al. Role of IFNγ in allograft tolerance mediated by CD4<sup>+</sup>CD25<sup>+</sup> regulatory T cells by induction of IDO in endothelial cells. Am J Transplant. 2007; 7:2472–2482. [PubMed: 17868070]
- Sundrud MS, et al. Halofuginone inhibits TH17 cell differentiation by activating the amino acid starvation response. Science. 2009; 324:1334–1338. [PubMed: 19498172]
- Beier UH, et al. Sirtuin-1 targeting promotes Foxp3<sup>+</sup> T-regulatory cell function and prolongs allograft survival. Mol Cell Biol. 2011; 31:1022–1029. [PubMed: 21199917]
- Tao R, et al. Deacetylase inhibition promotes the generation and function of regulatory T cells. Nat Med. 2007; 13:1299–1307. [PubMed: 17922010]
- Price NL, et al. SIRT1 is required for AMPK activation and the beneficial effects of resveratrol on mitochondrial function. Cell Metab. 2012; 15:675–690. [PubMed: 22560220]
- 85. Gatza E, et al. Manipulating the bioenergetics of alloreactive T cells causes their selective apoptosis and arrests graft-versus-host disease. Sci Transl Med. 2011; 3:67ra8.
- Byersdorfer CA, et al. Effector T cells require fatty acid metabolism during murine graft-versushost disease. Blood. 2013; 122:3230–3237. [PubMed: 24046012]

Newton et al.



### Figure 1.

Proposed model for the metabolic signatures of various T<sub>reg</sub> cell subsets. (a) Activated CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells that differentiate into the T<sub>eff</sub> cell lineage (green) (T<sub>H</sub>1 or T<sub>H</sub>17 cells) are dependent mainly on carbon substrates such as glucose and glutamine for their anabolic metabolism. In contrast to that, pTreg cells that potentially mirror activated T cells that have differentiated into the iTreg cell lineage in vitro (purple) can rely on exogenous lipids and glucose-derived pyruvate that they can oxidize in the TCA cycle. Owing to their substantial dependence on FAO, iTreg cells generate increased amounts of ROS but are resistant to ROS-mediated damage, as they might be armed with antioxidant molecules to maintain their integrity. However, the metabolic properties of tTreg cells (blue) seem to resemble those of activated T<sub>eff</sub> cells to a greater degree than those of their pT<sub>reg</sub> cell counterparts in that they might be more dependent on glucose and glutamine than on fatty acids. (b) T<sub>mem</sub> cells depend on glycolysis-driven lipogenesis and IL-7 receptor (IL-7R)-mediated expression of AQP9 for uptake of glycerol to generate cholesterol esters and triacylglycerols that can be hydrolyzed by LAL to mobilize free fatty acids (FA) to fuel FAO. Both tTreg cells and pTreg cells mirror certain metabolic properties of T<sub>mem</sub> cells, in that they seem to rely on glucose-derived lipogenesis and FAO, respectively. Furthermore, the activation of co-inhibitory receptors such as CTLA-4 and PD-1 (which inhibit glycolysis while promoting FAO in activated T cells) might potentially have a role in influencing FAO in pT<sub>reg</sub> cells. In particular, activation of PD-1 has been shown to upregulate the enzyme ATGL ('adipose triglyceride lipase') that hydrolyzes intracellular triacylglycerol (TAG) into glycerol-3-phosphate and fatty acids for their utilization in FAO in activated T cells. Thus, although like T<sub>mem</sub> cells, pT<sub>reg</sub> cells can

depend on FAO, the means by which they obtain fatty acids might be different. Whether  $tT_{reg}$  cells depend on FAO is yet to be determined.



#### Figure 2.

Effects of metabolism on Foxp3 expression and the generation of Treg cells. There are various scenarios in which T<sub>reg</sub> cell signaling and metabolic pathways might integrate and potentially affect Foxp3 expression. One of the downstream effects of an enhancement in glycolytic metabolism is the production of metabolic intermediates that can also function as signaling molecules (1). For example, NAD<sup>+</sup> and NADH might control Foxp3 stability via the activation of histone deacetylases such as SIRT proteins, which directly deacetylate Foxp3 in the nucleus and lead to its proteosomal degradation in the cytoplasm. Furthermore, the glycolytic enzyme enolase-1 can repress the FOXP3 splice variant containing exon 2 (E2) in human T<sub>reg</sub> cells, and its engagement in glycolysis serves as a mechanism by which glycolysis can control Foxp3 expression (2). Signaling molecules from glycolysis and mitochondrial metabolism (PEP and ROS) activate NFAT via Ca<sup>2+</sup> mobilization during T cell activation, a process that could potentially affect Foxp3 expression in T<sub>reg</sub> cells as well (3). Activation of Foxo transcription factors and HIF-1a downstream of the PI(3)K-AktmTOR signaling pathway can reciprocally affect Foxp3 expression (4). Finally, the chromatin-modifying enzyme EZH2 that is crucial for the establishment of a repressive  $T_{reg}$ cell gene program can be inhibited by specific microRNAs (such as miR-101 and miR-26a) under circumstances of glucose deprivation, which leads to  $T_{reg}$  cell instability (5). ETC, electron-transport chain; PRC, polycomb repressive complex; IP<sub>3</sub> and IP<sub>3</sub>R, inositol-1,3,4trisphosphate and its receptor.

Potential therapeutic	strategies for regulating	T <sub>reg</sub> cell metabolism for immunomod	ulation		
Molecule		Metabolic pathway affected	Mode of drug action and proposed effect	Implications and disease models	Refs.
Surface receptors	CTLA-4 and PD-1	CTLA-4 blocks glycolysis without augmenting FAO; PD-1 blocks glycolysis and enhances FAO in T <sub>eff</sub> cells by activating ATGL	Checkpoint blockade to enhance $T_{eff}$ cells while potentially inhibiting $T_{reg}$ cells that are reliant on FAO	Cancer therapy	48
	P2X7	Activation of P2X7 via ART by extracellular NAD <sup>+</sup> released during inflammation and cellular damage	Systemic administration of NAD <sup>+</sup> depletes 75–80% of $T_{reg}$ cells in mice; an NAD <sup>+</sup> inhibitor (the single-domain anti-body ART2.2) protects $T_{reg}$ cells from NICD	Cancer therapy; autoimmunity	71
	CD39-CD73 and A2AR	Catabolism of ATP to adenosine by $T_{reg}$ cells that in turn inhibits $T_{eff}$ cell responses via A2AR	CD39-CD73 blockade; CD39-CD73 activator; A2AR antagonists in next- generation checkpoint blockade	Cancer therapy; autoimmunity; transplantation	75-77
Intracellular kinases and phosphatases	PTEN	Inhibits PI(3)K-Akt signaling and glycolysis in $T_{\rm reg}$ cells	A PTEN inhibitor causes T <sub>reg</sub> cell destabilization and tumor regression	Cancer therapy; autoimmunity	45,47,78
	Leptin-mTOR signaling axis	mTOR promotes glycolysis via HIF-1 $\alpha$ and inhibits iTreg cells	Rapamycin blocks mTOR and enhances $T_{\rm neg}$ cell proliferation	EAE	17,34
	AMPK	Activates FAO and enhances iT <sub>reg</sub> cell generation	Metformin activates AMPK signaling and increases lipid oxidation	Allergic asthma	13
Metabolic enzymes	НК	Catalyzes the first rate-limiting reaction in glycolysis	2-DG blocks HK activity and glycolytic pathway	Prolongs allograft survival and diminishes EAE	17,20
	GLS	Converts glutamine to glutamate, the first step in gluatmine oxidation	DON blocks glutamine transport and glutaminase enzymes	DON, along with other metabolic inhibitors (2-DG and metformin), prolongs allograft survival	20
	PDHK1	Inhibits PDH (which catalyzes the conversion of pyruvate to acetyl-CoA) and indirectly enhances glycolysis	DCA blocks PDHK and increases the entry of pyruvate into the TCA cycle	Diminishes colitis, EAE and collagen-II-induced arthritis	16,79
	ACC	Carboxylates acteyl-coA to malonyl-CoA, which is essential for lipid synthesis	SorA blocks ACC and inhibits $T_H 17$ development and favors $T_{reg}$ cells	ACC blockade attenuates EAE	14
	HMGCR	Rate-limiting enzyme involved in the synthesis of cholesterol and isoprenoid lipids that are required for coordinating $T_{\rm reg}$ cell proliferation and optimal induction of CTLA-4 and ICOS in an mTORC1-dependent manner	25-hydroxycholesterol (general lipid- synthesis inhibitor) and drugs such as simvastatin, atorvastatin and lovastatin inhibit HMGCR and impair the suppressive activity of Treg cells	Cancer therapy	18
	IDO	Tryptophan-catabolizing enzyme expressed by dendritic cells that suppresses T cell responses by upregulating PD-1 on T <sub>reg</sub> cells via amino-acid-sensitive GCN2, which blocks mTOR	IDO-inhibitor drugs can increase Akt phosphorylation in $T_{reg}$ cells; interferon- $\gamma$ and CTLA 4–1g can enhance IDO expression in dendritic cells; the small molecule halofuginone	Cancer therapy; allogenic bone- marrow transplantation; EAE	47,80,81

Nat Immunol. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 August 31.

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Table 1

Newton et al.

Author Manuscript

Molecule		Metabolic pathway affected	Mode of drug action and proposed effect	Implications and disease models	Refs.
			activates GCN2 (AAR) and inhibits $T_{\rm H}17$ differentiation		
	SIRTI	Activated by an increase in the NAD <sup>+</sup> /NADH ratio and can directly deacetylate Foxp3, which leads to its proteosomal degradation	Inhibitors EX527 and splitomycin block SIRT1 activity; resveratrol supports mitochondrial biogenesis in a SIRT1-dependent manner	Prolongation of allograft survival	82–84
	Mitochondrial ATPase	Crucial for mitochondrial oxidative phosphorylation	Small-molecule inhibitor (Bz-423) that inhibits mitochondrial F1F0 ATPase in alloreactive T cells that depends on FAO in a GVHD model	Bone-marrow transplantation	85,86
Metabolic intermediates	PEP	One of the products of glycolysis (enhanced by PCK1) that sustains Ca <sup>2+</sup> mobilization and NFAT signaling by inhibiting SERCA activity	Enhances $T_{\rm eff}$ responses, effect on $T_{\rm reg}$ cell TBD	Anti-tumor immunity	19
	a-KG	Glutamine-derived TCA cycle metabolite	The $\alpha$ -KG analog DMK enhances T-bet expression and T <sub>H</sub> 1 responses, while a decrease in $\alpha$ -KG can enhance T <sub>reg</sub> cells	Glutamine deprivation enhances the suppressive activity of $T_{\rm reg}$ cells in an autoimmune colitis model	22
	Mevalonate	A metabolite in the lipid-synthesis pathway downstream of HMGCR	Mevalonate completely reverses the effects of statins (described above) and is involved in maintaining $T_{reg}$ cell functional fitness in an mTORC1-dependent manner	Autoimmunity	18
Chromatin modifiers	EZH2	Associates with Foxp3 to create repressive chromatin but is also crucial for establishing polyfunctionality in $T_{eff}$ cells	Glucose deprivation inhibits EZH2 by microRNAs and $T_{eff}$ cell function; net effect of EZH2 inhibitors on $T_{reg}$ cells is TBD	Cancer; autoimmunity	63,64
HK. hexokinase: GLS. plut	aminase: EAE. experimental au	utoimmune encephalitis: ACC. acetyl-CoA carboxyla	se: HMGCR. 3-hvdroxv-3-methylelutryl-Co	hoA reductase: a-KG, a-ketoolutarate: ]	1 6

Nat Immunol. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 August 31.

dimethyl a-ketoglutarate; ICOS, effector molecule; NICD, NAD<sup>+</sup>-induced T cell death; DCA, dichloroacetate; SorA, soraphen; Ig, immunoglobulin; AAR, amino-acid-starvation response; F1F0 ATPase, F-type ATPase (ATP synthase); GVHD, graft-versus-host disease; PCK1, kinase; TBD, to be determined.