

Jens Hutzschenreuter

Management Control in Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises

GABLER RESEARCH

Entrepreneurship

Herausgegeben von
Professor Dr. Malte Brettel, RWTH Aachen,
Professor Dr. Lambert T. Koch, Universität Wuppertal,
Professor Dr. Tobias Kollmann, Universität Duisburg-Essen,
Campus Essen,
Professor Dr. Peter Witt, Universität Dortmund

„Entrepreneurship“ ist ein noch relativ junger Forschungszweig, der jedoch in Wissenschaft und Praxis stetig an Bedeutung gewinnt. Denn Unternehmensgründungen und deren Promotoren nehmen für die wirtschaftliche Entwicklung einen zentralen Stellenwert ein, so dass es nur folgerichtig ist, dem auch in Forschung und Lehre Rechnung zu tragen.

Die Schriftenreihe bietet ein Forum für wissenschaftliche Beiträge zur Entrepreneurship-Thematik. Ziel ist der Transfer von aktuellen Forschungsergebnissen und deren Diskussion aus der Wissenschaft in die Unternehmenspraxis.

Jens Hutzschenreuter

Management Control in Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises

Indirect Control Forms,
Control Combinations and their Effect
on Company Performance

With a foreword by Prof. Dr. Malte Brettel



RESEARCH

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek
The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie;
detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

D 82 (Diss. RWTH Aachen, 2009)

1st Edition 2009

All rights reserved

© Gabler | GWV Fachverlage GmbH, Wiesbaden 2009

Editorial Office: Claudia Jeske | Nicole Schweitzer

Gabler is part of the specialist publishing group Springer Science+Business Media.
www.gabler.de



No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the copyright holder.

Registered and/or industrial names, trade names, trade descriptions etc. cited in this publication are part of the law for trade-mark protection and may not be used free in any form or by any means even if this is not specifically marked.

Umschlaggestaltung: KünkelLopka Medienentwicklung, Heidelberg
Printed on acid-free paper
Printed in Germany

ISBN 978-3-8349-1990-8

Foreword

Management control is one of the key management functions, but has been rarely addressed in academic research. Amongst other reasons, this disinterest might be rooted in the typically negative connotation of the term ‘control’. Academics rather prefer topics like strategy development, planning or organizational topics over control. Paradoxically, academics and managers both are highly interested and concerned with visions, strategies and plans; however, the majority of them fail or are not implemented successfully. One of the key reasons for this is the fact that the implementation and the subsequent control conducted by managers are often neglected.

Managers could delegate the execution of plans and strategies to their subordinates; however, they have to take into consideration which activities can be delegated and how the progress should be controlled. Neither science nor practice has been able to provide acceptable answers to this open issue; thus there is a significant research gap. The research gap in the context of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) is even larger – control here has been explored only in a considerably small number of studies. In the setting of small and medium-sized enterprises previous research has already demonstrated that management control is of greater importance than planning activities. This highlights the relevance of the research problem on how control should be executed in SMEs again.

The thesis of Jens Hutzschenreuter specifically addresses this research topic. For his research he aims at “enhancing the knowledge about management control forms in general, with special emphasis on SMEs” and achieves this in a very interesting way.

The thesis of Mr. Hutzschenreuter is not only theoretically well-founded, it also presents an extensive empirical testing of the theoretically developed assumptions. The results are of particular interest for both researchers and practitioners. Typically, managers employ direct forms of control by defining results and processes for subordinates although these control forms show only limited effectiveness. At the same time, the effect of indirect control mechanisms like employee selection and the company culture's impact on the employees' behavior is often neglected. The performance of indirect management control has shown a consistently greater impact than direct forms of control. Moreover, the results show a broad applicability also in other organizational settings.

Mr. Hutzschenreuter has not only written a thesis that is highly sophisticated from a theoretical point of view which will guide future researchers in this domain, he also produced very interesting findings which are helpful for the demanding managerial practice.

In this respect, I wish that this thesis will receive the broad audience it deserves.

Malte Brettel

Preface

This study was accepted as a dissertation in the summer of 2009 at the Faculty for Business and Economics of the RWTH Aachen University. I know that this would not have materialised without the comprehensive support of various people.

In the first place, I would like to thank my doctoral father, Prof. Dr. Malte Brettel, for accepting me as a research assistant. At his chair, he has developed an amazing working culture that fosters individual development and at the same time provides guidance on how to tackle the numerous difficulties in a doctoral thesis. By doing so, he significantly supported this thesis. Secondly, I want to express my gratitude to Prof. Ian MacMillan, DBA, Professor of Management at the Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania. I thank him for the opportunity to participate in his Visiting Scholar Program in the year 2008. The discussion with him and his team contributed significantly to deepen the understanding of the topic and this thesis. Furthermore, I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Rüdiger von Nitzsch for taking over the role of the second advisor.

My colleagues at the Chair of Business Administration for Engineers and Scientists also contributed to this dissertation in various ways. The traditional "Lehrstuhltag" facilitated great discussions and fun both during the day- and night-time activities. The work together with my colleagues Tessa and Sebastian for the automotive innovation network car Aachen e.V. was challenging but at the same time associated with a lot of fun and great results.

I would also like to thank all my friends in supporting me during the work on the dissertation. It was great to have the assurance that I would have their support even during difficult times. I particularly thank Andreas, Jens, Kathrin & André, Manuel and Thomas who were always there to listen to my worries.

Above all, I am deeply thankful to my family: to my sister Anke who helped me with her strong analytical focus in the statistics section and with her fruitful advice during the writing phase, and to my parents, Brigitte and Paul Hutzschenreuter, who contributed with their ability to motivate me and with their tremendous support throughout my education. Hence, I dedicate this thesis to my family, with the conviction that it would have been impossible to come this far without their timely help and support.

Jens Hutzschenreuter

Overview of contents

Foreword V

Preface VII

Overview of contents IX

Table of contents XI

List of figures XVII

List of tables XIX

List of abbreviations XXI

1 Introduction 1

1.1 Problem statement 1

1.2 Relevant research 3

1.3 Research questions 10

1.4 Structure of this study 14

2 Conceptual basics 17

2.1 Foundations and understanding of terms 17

2.2 Key concepts of management control and their applications 25

2.3 SMEs and their liabilities 58

3 Theoretical framework 63

3.1 Potential frameworks and selection of a framework 63

3.2 Agency theory 67

3.3 Social control theory 75

3.4 Application of the research framework 80

4 Hypotheses and research model 86

4.1 Direct effect of management control forms 86

4.2 Control combinations 98

4.3 Moderating effects on management control forms 102

4.4 Research model and summary of hypotheses 111

5	Preparation of empirical analysis	112
5.1	<i>Methodology</i>	<i>112</i>
5.2	<i>Measures</i>	<i>122</i>
6	Survey design and sample	135
6.1	<i>Preparation of the data sample</i>	<i>135</i>
6.2	<i>Assessment of the data sample</i>	<i>142</i>
6.3	<i>Determination of required significance level</i>	<i>152</i>
7	Empirical results	156
7.1	<i>Main model</i>	<i>156</i>
7.2	<i>Control combinations</i>	<i>169</i>
7.3	<i>Moderating effects</i>	<i>174</i>
7.4	<i>Results overview</i>	<i>183</i>
8	Discussion and conclusion	185
8.1	<i>Reflection on research questions</i>	<i>185</i>
8.2	<i>Review of the findings of the study</i>	<i>187</i>
8.3	<i>Research implications</i>	<i>201</i>
8.4	<i>Managerial implications</i>	<i>213</i>
9	Appendix	219
9.1	<i>(A) Cover letter</i>	<i>220</i>
9.2	<i>(B) Initial reminder</i>	<i>221</i>
9.3	<i>(C) Second reminder</i>	<i>222</i>
9.4	<i>(D) Questionnaire</i>	<i>223</i>
9.5	<i>(F) Tables</i>	<i>228</i>
10	Bibliography	239

Table of contents

Foreword	V
Preface	VII
Overview of contents	IX
Table of contents.....	XI
List of figures	XVII
List of tables	XIX
List of abbreviations.....	XXI
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Problem statement	1
1.2 Relevant research.....	3
1.3 Research questions.....	10
1.4 Structure of this study	14
2 Conceptual basics	17
2.1 Foundations and understanding of terms	17
2.1.1 Management control	17
2.1.2 Small and medium sized enterprises	20
2.1.3 Distinction of management control from other terms	22
2.2 Key concepts of management control and their applications	25
2.2.1 Control strategies	25
2.2.1.1 Goals of a control system.....	25
2.2.1.2 Parameters of a control system	27
2.2.1.2.1 Control subject.....	27
2.2.1.2.2 Control object.....	28
2.2.1.2.3 Control relationships.....	32
2.2.1.2.4 Control intensity.....	34
2.2.1.2.5 Control techniques	35
2.2.1.3 Integration into the management process	37

2.2.2	Research framework for management control.....	39
2.2.2.1	Overview of potential frameworks	40
2.2.2.1.1	System based views of control.....	41
2.2.2.1.2	Alternative frameworks to management control.....	43
2.2.2.2	Selection of a framework	44
2.2.2.3	Description of selected framework	45
2.2.3	Combinations of management control forms	48
2.2.4	Performance consequences and moderating effects	52
2.2.4.1	Management control performance consequences	53
2.2.4.2	Moderators of the performance effect.....	56
2.3	<i>SMEs and their liabilities</i>	58
3	Theoretical framework.....	63
3.1	<i>Potential frameworks and selection of a framework</i>	63
3.2	<i>Agency theory</i>	67
3.2.1	Issues and suggested solutions	69
3.2.2	Critique	73
3.3	<i>Social control theory</i>	75
3.3.1	Issues and suggested solutions	77
3.3.2	Critique	80
3.4	<i>Application of the research framework</i>	80
3.4.1	Contributions to the problem of MCS in SMEs	81
3.4.2	Relationship between theories and control forms.....	82
4	Hypotheses and research model.....	86
4.1	<i>Direct effect of management control forms</i>	86
4.1.1	Results control.....	87
4.1.1.1	Theoretical considerations	87
4.1.1.2	Results control in large organizations.....	87
4.1.1.3	Results control in SMEs.....	89
4.1.2	Behavior control	89
4.1.2.1	Theoretical considerations	89
4.1.2.2	Behavior control in large organizations	90
4.1.2.3	Behavior control in SMEs.....	91

4.1.3	Personnel control	92
4.1.3.1	Theoretical considerations	92
4.1.3.2	Personnel control in large organizations.....	93
4.1.3.3	Personnel control in SMEs.....	94
4.1.4	Cultural Control.....	95
4.1.4.1	Theoretical considerations	95
4.1.4.2	Cultural control in large organizations	96
4.1.4.3	Cultural control in SMEs	97
4.2	<i>Control combinations</i>	98
4.2.1	Theoretical considerations	98
4.2.2	Control combinations in large organizations.....	101
4.3	<i>Moderating effects on management control forms</i>	102
4.3.1	Age.....	103
4.3.1.1	Theoretical considerations	103
4.3.1.2	Empirical findings.....	104
4.3.2	Size	105
4.3.2.1	Theoretical considerations	105
4.3.2.2	Empirical findings.....	105
4.3.3	Life cycle stage.....	107
4.3.3.1	Theoretical considerations	107
4.3.3.2	Empirical findings.....	107
4.3.4	Management experience	109
4.3.4.1	Theoretical considerations	109
4.3.4.2	Empirical findings.....	109
4.4	<i>Research model and summary of hypotheses</i>	111
5	Preparation of empirical analysis	112
5.1	<i>Methodology</i>	112
5.1.1	Selection of analysis methodology	112
5.1.1.1	Multivariate statistics.....	112
5.1.1.2	Key principles of structural equation models	113
5.1.2	Choice for variance based analysis with PLS.....	116
5.1.3	Partial least square algorithm	118
5.1.3.1	General description	118
5.1.3.2	Moderating effects and group comparisons	120

5.2	<i>Measures</i>	122
5.2.1	Main model.....	125
5.2.2	Moderating and control variables.....	132
6	Survey design and sample	135
6.1	<i>Preparation of the data sample</i>	135
6.1.1	Selection and design of data collection method.....	135
6.1.2	Aggregation of sample.....	140
6.1.3	Conducting the survey.....	141
6.2	<i>Assessment of the data sample</i>	142
6.2.1	Responses.....	143
6.2.2	Treatment of missing data.....	144
6.2.3	Representativeness of sample.....	147
6.2.4	Analysis of biases.....	148
6.2.5	Description of data sample.....	150
6.3	<i>Determination of required significance level</i>	152
7	Empirical results	156
7.1	<i>Main model</i>	156
7.1.1	Measurement model.....	156
7.1.1.1	Reflective measurement models.....	157
7.1.1.1.1	Assessment of reliability.....	157
7.1.1.1.2	Assessment of validity.....	160
7.1.1.2	Formative measurement models.....	163
7.1.1.2.1	Assessment of reliability.....	163
7.1.1.2.2	Assessment of validity.....	166
7.1.2	Structural model.....	167
7.2	<i>Control combinations</i>	169
7.3	<i>Moderating effects</i>	174
7.3.1	Group segmentation.....	175
7.3.2	Company age as a moderator.....	176
7.3.3	Company size as a moderator.....	178
7.3.4	Company life cycle stage as a moderator.....	179
7.3.5	Management experience as a moderator.....	181
7.3.6	Control variables: finance structure and sector affiliation.....	182
7.4	<i>Results overview</i>	183

8	Discussion and conclusion.....	185
8.1	<i>Reflection on research questions</i>	<i>185</i>
8.2	<i>Review of the findings of the study.....</i>	<i>187</i>
8.2.1	Findings on the individual control forms	187
8.2.2	Findings on the combination of control forms	192
8.2.3	Evaluation of the contingency perspective on management control	194
8.2.4	Evaluation of company age as a contingent factor	197
8.2.5	Integration and overlap with other research areas	200
8.3	<i>Research implications.....</i>	<i>201</i>
8.3.1	Contribution to research	201
8.3.1.1	Conceptual perspective	201
8.3.1.2	Theoretical perspective	206
8.3.1.3	Methodological perspective	208
8.3.2	Limitations of this study and directions for further research.....	210
8.3.2.1	Methodological limitations	210
8.3.2.2	Conceptual limitations	212
8.4	<i>Managerial implications.....</i>	<i>213</i>
8.4.1	Implications for owners-managers of SMEs	213
8.4.2	Implications for venture capitalists and other stakeholders.....	217
9	Appendix.....	219
9.1	<i>(A) Cover letter</i>	<i>220</i>
9.2	<i>(B) Initial reminder.....</i>	<i>221</i>
9.3	<i>(C) Second reminder</i>	<i>222</i>
9.4	<i>(D) Questionnaire</i>	<i>223</i>
9.5	<i>(F) Tables.....</i>	<i>228</i>
10	Bibliography.....	239

List of figures

Figure 1: Research questions of the dissertation 13

Figure 2: Potential control comparisons..... 29

Figure 3: Choice between results and behavior control 32

Figure 4: Management processes and the integration of control 37

Figure 5: Overview of considered research frameworks 40

Figure 6: Overview of selected research framework 47

Figure 7: Overview of management control combinations 52

Figure 8: Selection of a theoretical framework..... 65

Figure 9: Theoretical suggestions from agency theory 72

Figure 10: Conceptual relationships between control theories and research framework..... 84

Figure 11: Summary of hypotheses..... 111

Figure 12: Composition of structural equation models..... 115

Figure 13: Partial least square estimation algorithm 119

Figure 14: Distribution of respondents along time..... 142

Figure 15: Overview of response rates..... 144

Figure 16: Treatment of missing data 145

Figure 17: Distribution of responding companies by postal code..... 147

Figure 18: Distribution of responding companies by industry affiliation code 148

Figure 19: Distribution of responding companies by company age..... 151

Figure 20: Distribution of responding companies by revenue class 151

Figure 21: Distribution of responding companies by company size class 152

Figure 22: Inference testing and associated errors 153

Figure 23: Factors influencing statistical power analysis 154

Figure 24: Summary of main model results 169

Figure 25: Usage patterns of control combinations 171

Figure 26: Summary of results on control combinations (two control combinations)..... 172

Figure 27: Summary of results on control combinations (all control combinations)..... 174

Figure 28: Summary of impact of moderators on control effectiveness..... 195

Figure 29: Summary of results on direct control intensity decrease..... 198

List of tables

Table 1: Summary of empirical findings on management control in SMEs	8
Table 2: Structure of this study	16
Table 3: Liabilities of SMEs in relation to management control	62
Table 4: Construct specification decision rules.....	125
Table 5: Operationalization “Results Control”	126
Table 6: Operationalization “Behavior control”	127
Table 7: Operationalization “Personnel control”	128
Table 8: Operationalization “Cultural control”	129
Table 9: Operationalization “Subjective company performance”	131
Table 10: Operationalization “Company life cycle stage”	133
Table 11: Required significance levels	155
Table 12: Descriptive analysis of constructs.....	156
Table 13: Indicator and construct reliability for “Behavior control”	158
Table 14: Indicator and construct reliability for “Cultural control”	159
Table 15: Discriminant validity on indicator level.....	161
Table 16: Discriminant analysis on construct level	161
Table 17: Quality assessment of reflective measures based on CFA.....	162
Table 18: Reliability measures “Results control”	164
Table 19: Reliability measures “Personnel control”	165
Table 20: Reliability measures “Subjective company performance”	166
Table 21: Evaluation of control combinations with ANCOVA	172
Table 22: Evaluation of control combination’s performance consequences.....	173
Table 23: Results group comparison company age.....	177
Table 24: Results group comparison company size	179
Table 25: Results group comparison company life cycle	180
Table 26: Results group comparison management experience	182
Table 27: Summary of hypotheses testing	184
Table 28: Summary of moderating effects on indirect control effectiveness	196
Table 29: Descriptive analysis of all indicators	228
Table 30: Overview of missing values by indicator.....	229
Table 31: Group comparison company age.....	230
Table 32: Discriminant validity – company age – group 1	231
Table 33: Discriminant validity – company age – group 2	231
Table 34: Group comparison company size.....	232
Table 35: Discriminant validity – company size – group 1	233
Table 36: Discriminant validity – company size – group 2	233
Table 37: Group comparison company life cycle stage	234

Table 38: Discriminant validity – company life cycle - group 1	235
Table 39: Discriminant validity – company life cycle – group 2.....	235
Table 40: Group comparison management experience.....	236
Table 41: Discriminant validity – management experience– group 1	237
Table 42: Discriminant validity – management experience– group 2	237
Table 43: Linearity assumption analysis.....	238

List of abbreviations

AMOS	-	Analysis of Moment Structures
AoMJ	-	Academy of Management Journal
AoM	-	Academy of Management
AVE	-	Average variance extracted
BC	-	Behavior control
CC	-	Cultural control
Cf.	-	Compare (latin: confer)
CFA	-	Confirmatory factor analysis
CI	-	Condition index
CoC	-	Coefficient of Congruence
df	-	Degrees of freedom
ed.	-	Edition/editor
EM algorithm	-	Expectation Maximization algorithm
EVA	-	Economical Value Added
GDP	-	Gross Domestic Product
LISREL	-	Linear Structural Relations
MCS	-	Management control system
NEF	-	New economy firm
PDF	-	Portable document format
PLS	-	Partial Least Squares
PC	-	Personnel control
RC	-	Results control
SEM	-	Structural equation model(ing)
SME	-	Small and medium-sized enterprise
p./pp.	-	Page/pages
SPSS	-	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
TQM	-	Total Quality Management
US(A)	-	United States (of America)
VIF	-	Variance inflation factor